# **CONTENTS OF MEDIA INFORMATION KIT**

## (5 Jan 2005)

- Introduction to ALFP Migration & Media Project
- ALFP 2001 Fellows (Biographies)
- Definitions
- Historical & Cultural Summary
- Social and Political/Legal Summary
- Economic & Security Summary

Media Survey – Top Findings & Recommendations Country Summaries

# **INTRODUCTION**

#### Asia Leadership Fellow Programme (ALFP)

The Asia Leadership Fellow Programme (ALFP) was created jointly by the International House of Japan, and the Japan Foundation in 1996, and was designed to provide selected public intellectuals in the Asian region with an opportunity to spend two to three months in Japan to engage in collaborative discussion on issues pertinent to the region, as well as their own individual research and exchange activities. Although there many frameworks in Asia for dialogue on the governmental and semi-governmental levels to promote closer regional ties, there are few opportunities for Asian intellectuals to engage in dialogue and exchange on human development issues in the region. This Program is designed specifically to enhance intellectual dialogue and exchange among intellectuals in Asia who may share the same concerns about region's future, and generally to promote understanding and co-operation in order to identify fundamental problems and further the region's development.

#### ALFP 2001

In October 2001, seven fellows of the Asia Leadership Fellow Program - from China, India, Malaysia, the Philippines, Thailand, Japan and Korea - started research on an issue they felt was critical to the future of the region: Migration. The research included, looking at the relationship between public attitudes, government policies and media coverage, on foreign migrants. It was their belief then, as it is even more so now, after concluding the research, that media, public opinion, government policy- making and the conditions and treatment of migrants are all spokes of a single wheel that can be influenced - constructively - through a more informed, sensitive and responsible media environment. This environment includes editorial policies, and individual journalists and media executives who rarely come under the focus of media (and therefore public attention and accountability). While 'the media' is often criticised for sensationalism, the ALFP2001 fellows regarded it important to look more closely at the constraints that media journalists and executives face, as well as at their sources of information.

#### ALFP 2001- MIGRATION AND MEDIA PROJECT

Originally titled, "Re-mapping Migration" in 2001, the Project was completed in a period of three years, from 2002-2004 at a cost of approximately USD37,000, sponsored by the Japan Foundation. The project developed as "Migration and Media – A Case Study", and covered two phases. Phase I included seven researchers, two doubling up as Authorised Representative, and Project Director, researching and writing original full-length country reports, covering reviews of existing migration literature, legal and social frameworks, and identification of key migration issues in each of the seven countries. Phase II of the Project included a meeting for all seven country Fellows to present and discuss research findings, to finalise and carry out further research and documentation, particularly on media coverage (the most popular newspapers, and tv news bulletin broadcasts in each country), resulting in additional written summaries, and this media information kit.

# **ALFP2001 Fellows (Biographies)**

**1. Dr Huang Ping, Authorised Representative, Researcher (CHINA)** Director, Institute of Sociology, Chinese Academy of Social Sciences, Beijing



With a PhD from London School of Economics (LSE), University of London, Professor Huang is an internationally acclaimed sociologist. As an erudite scholar, he has written numerous books and papers in the field of the social sciences. In his empirical studies of contemporary Chinese society, he attempts to re-examine the validity of Western conceptional frameworks in the social sciences. Through various UN-related activities, he explores the application and implementation of theoretical studies and research into action.

**2. Ann Lee, Project Director, Researcher (MALAYSIA)** Managing Director, Kuali Works; Trustee, Asia Pacific Council of AIDS Service Organisations



A former newscaster with Malaysian national television network, RTM (TV2), Ms. Lee also hails from the arts, corporate, and NGO sectors. She is a writer, director, editor, and co-founder of *Kuali Works*, a theatre, television and publishing company. She was Associate Creative Director of a leading corporate communications consultancy, the highlight of which was working on a voter education campaign for the African National Congress (ANC) in South Africa's first democratic elections. She is also trustee of the Asia Pacific Council of AIDS Service Organisations (APCASO), and is currently pursuing a Masters degree at Oxford University.

## **3. David Celdran, Researcher (PHILIPPINES)** Head, Current Affairs Division, ABS-CBN



Mr. Celdran is a well-known broadcast journalist and producer in the Philippines. As programming head of the Current Affairs division of the Philippines' biggest news organization, ABS-CBN, he is in charge of the programming and production of the channel's talk and debate programs. He plays a pivotal role in the reform of the TV community in the country as a member of the Philippine Center for Investigative Journalism. Through his career as a prominent TV journalist, he is well aware of the powerful role of TV media in the formation of public perception.

## **4. Dr Ryu Jeong Soon, Researcher (KOREA)** President, Korea Research & Consulting Institute on Poverty



Dr. Ryu is a reputable scholar and an influential NGO activist in the field of social welfare. Her scholarly achievements have gained significant worldwide recognition. In particular, her research on "Poverty Problems in Korea after the Foreign Currency Crisis" triggered repercussions in Korean society, thereby leading to government welfare policy reform. In close partnership with NGOs, she monitors government policy and provides reference materials for social welfare policy improvement.

## **5. Dr Mahendra Lama, Researcher (INDIA)** Professor of South Asian Economies, Jawaharlal Nehru University



Professor Lama is a distinguished social scientist in India. Central to his intellectual pursuits is economic development and cooperation in South Asia. While teaching economic cooperation and integration in South Asia and India's Foreign Economic Policy, he does extensive research with distinct policy slants. He was the member from India of the Independent Expert Group set up by the South Asian Association for Regional Co-operation (SAARC). His major works on trade, development, technology, investment and energy have been published in many prestigious journals and translated into a number of foreign languages including Japanese, French and German. A prolific writer, he is also the Economic Adviser to the Government of Sikkim at Minister of State rank. The "Human Development Approach" employed in his analysis is regarded as paving the way for a new perspective on development in the region.

## 6. Dr Anek Nakabutara, Researcher (THAILAND)



Mr Anek Nakabutara is an experienced expert in rural planning and development. As a former UNDP officer, he was instrumental in establishing the Social Fund Office. Its chief objective was to administer social investment funds from the World Bank in order to mitigate various social problems in Thailand. His long-time dedicated efforts to improve Thai society are widely recognized. Due to his contribution, he was nominated as a representative to America from Southeast Asian countries in 1996.

## **7. Asato Wako, Researcher (JAPAN)** Research Fellow of the Japan Society for the Promotion of Science



Mr Asato, currently reading for a PhD in Economics at the University of Ryukoku, Japan, is a specialist in migration issues relating to East and Southeast Asia, and has written about economic policy and migration issues in Korea, Taiwan, Hong Kong, the Philippines and Indonesia. Presently conducting research on the Filipino Diaspora in Asia, he has also worked with both private and government institutes in Japan to develop support and management systems.

## 8. Ms Prasopsee Sookmark, Assistant Researcher (THAILAND)



Ms Prasopsee Sookmark was formerly Head, Secretariat, of the Social Fund Office, Government Savings Bank, and is currently Researcher-Coordinator of the Local Knowledge Management Institute, in Bangkok, Thailand.

## 9. Dr Masataka Okamoto, Research Contributor (JAPAN)

Associate Professor, Fukuoka Prefectural University

## **10.** Dr Supang Chantavanich, Research Contributor (THAILAND)

Professor, Sociology and Anthropology, Chulalongkorn University; Director, Institute of Asian Studies, Chulalongkorn University

# DEFINITIONS

#### Migrants/migrant workers

The term "migrant worker" refers to "a person who is to be engaged, is engaged or has been engaged in a remunerated activity in a State of which he or she is not a national."

There are certain categories of migrant workers and their families, including: "frontier workers; seasonal workers; seafarers; workers on offshore installations; itinerant workers; migrants employed for a specific project; and self-employed workers".

(From the *UN International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families*, entered into force on 1 July 2003. The Convention provides a set of binding international standards to address the treatment, welfare and human rights of both documented and undocumented migrants as well as the obligations and responsibilities on the part of the sending and receiving States. In particular, it seeks to put an end to the illegal or clandestine recruitment and trafficking of migrant workers and discourage the employment of migrant workers in an irregular or undocumented situation. The Convention has been ratified or acceded to by the following 21 States: Azerbaijan, Belize, Bolivia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Cape Verde, Colombia, Ecuador, Egypt, El Salvador, Ghana, Guatemala, Guinea, Mexico, Morocco, Philippines, Senegal, Seychelles, Sri Lanka, Tajikistan, Uganda and Uruguay.)

#### **Regular/Irregular migrants**

"Irregular" or undocumented migrants is often used in place of "illegal" migrants, in keeping with United Nations General Assembly Resolution 3449 terminology, which seeks to avoid the negative connotations associated with the term 'illegal', since this does not accurately account for the difficulties that migrants may face in trying to legally register.

#### **Cross-border**

In this information kit, cross-border is used interchangeably with trans-border or transnational.

#### Refugees

This refers to a person who is outside his/her country of nationality or habitual residence; has a well-founded fear of persecution because of his/her race, religion, nationality, membership in a particular social group, or political opinion; and is unable or unwilling to avail him/herself of the protection of that country, or to return there, for fear of persecution. Refugees are distinguished from economic migrants who have voluntarily left their country of origin for economic reasons.

## HISTORICAL & CULTURAL SUMMARY By Ann Lee

While religious and scientific references to the exact origins of the human species differ, archaeological evidence suggests that the first migratory movements of the first upright human species, *homo erectus*, occurred from Africa into Asia and Europe, one million years ago. Even as this evidence is open to debate - with alternative theses posing that *homo sapiens* emerged around 150,000 BCE in an apparently direct line from *homo erectus*, but that separate journeys were carried out from various areas of the globe - migration is not at all new. Migration is as old as Man.

Migration has been essential for the development of human society, by finding better sources of food and shelter, or in more modern times, employment and education. Indeed, migration is an integral part of what is today known as 'globalisation'. This so-called phenomenon is perhaps best described by Nobel laureate, Amartya Sen, as an *"intensification* of the processes of human interaction involving travel, trade, migration and dissemination of knowledge that have shaped the progress of the world over millennia."

#### Migration in ancient terms

In moving from one place to another, settling and moving on again, combinations of both 'indigenous' and 'foreign' peoples have founded all cultures and civilisations, including those in the countries under survey in this Project. A great civilisation has rarely, if ever, developed purely in isolation, without inter-marriage or inter-cultural activity, such as managing a population of various cultural types. Yet distinguishing between indigenous and foreign can be arbitrary: What is the very notion of 'indigenous', if all Man came from Africa? To put it another way: Who was here first? All our ancestors were here first.

#### Migration in modern terms

Nevertheless, the words 'indigenous' or aboriginal and 'foreign' are helpful to distinguish between past and present 'waves' of migrants. While migration is nothing new, waves of migration in ancient and modern times are certainly different in nature, scale and consequence. Migration brings about both old and new problems; fresh matters for generations in most geographical areas to reckon with.

Significantly today, the largest flows of migrants are to developing countries, 65 million (or 54%) rather than to developed countries (45%) as often assumed. Asia accounted for the greatest movements of migrants with 43 million migrant populations; that is 36% of all migrants and 66% of all migrant workers migrating to developing countries.

(ILO, Migrant Workers, International Labour Conference, 87<sup>th</sup> session, Geneva 1999, Report III:4)

#### Types of migration

Yet people do move themselves, of their own choice, more voluntary than forced, and for a wide variety of reasons. Besides the reasons for migration identified by the researchers in this Project, respected historian Wang Gungwu also notes three major varieties of migration in Asian history.

1) The first is of large group migrations – of tribes, nations or whole communities. They "invariably led to conflict and then either to conquest of territory or defeat, slaughter, and possible enslavement of the losers. The new borders that were then erected would discourage, if not end, migrations for a long time."

2) The second is of "enforced migrations" of smaller groups due to natural disasters, famines or plagues. Some became "colonists or refugees or offered themselves if not as slaves then as bonded or contract labour of one kind or another". Obstacles to migration included "host communities that despised the newcomers" which in modern times, "includes immigration officials and trade unions."

3) The third variety of migration features "sojourners" who eventually became migrants. The modern equivalent are "middle class and educated people who wish to postpone as long as possible the final decision on whether to migrate and settle abroad".

(Don't Leave Home: Migration and the Chinese; Wang Gung Wu, Times Academic Press, 2001)

#### **Migrants : Forward and Backward linkages**

Modern countries generally benefit the most from migrants coming into the country (refugees may pose more difficulties), in terms of economic growth used for human development – a better quality of life through better diet, shelter and education. But these benefits may be enjoyed by citizens of both receiving and sending countries, as migrants send significant sums of money back to their relatives - so much so that the local and greater economy of the sending country can be substantially improved. In 2003, according to the International Organisation for Migration, the money sent home by international migrants to developing countries, through official channels, amounted to USD93 billion. This astonishing figure - not counting unofficial channels of money transfer, which could be twice as much - exceeds the USD68.5 billion that developed countries currently spend on official development assistance.

However, there are, of course, associated 'ills' to do with migrants, ranging from minor lifestyle change to economic and physical displacement, disease and crime. Like all the oldest issues for mankind, these are not simple problems to address for mutual benefit. But, opinions that reduce the contribution of migrants to only negative terms – 'stealing our resources, women and jobs' - reduce a complex issue into convenient but false notions of 'us' and 'them'. Constant criticisms by NGOs that protect their own specific areas of concern, or that dismiss legal or bureaucratic procedures all too quickly, also run the risk of over-simplification.

#### Migration and the need to 'preserve our race/culture'

Few, if any cultures remain alive and intact without some outside cultural influence ensuring continuity. Of course, a culture may end as a result of outside influence – that is, through war or disease. But generally speaking, culture is a living thing. It evolves. Culture does not stand still. Yet claims are often made to 'preserve our culture' - as if culture does or can stand still – and are often part of 'last bastion' arguments against globalisation. Certainly, it can be said that globalisation's benefits are still not enjoyed by more than two thirds of the world. (Of the world population of 6 billion, 4.8 billion live in developing countries, and 1.2 billion live in the developed world.) But to use globalisation in this way can be an excuse to oversimplify the ways that a country's cultures come about. It is appealing to have an easy answer to a difficult question.

**False arguments and oversimplifications** The rush to maintain 'one pure race' is an important example of oversimplification. The notion of cultural or ethnic purity has been an issue of concern, if not a political strategy, for both ancient and modern nations. Unfortunately, as noted by Mahendra Lama in this Project, efforts to achieve cultural homogeneity, foreign policy objectives, or to neutralise political enemies, have often resulted in a government finding ways to 'generate' emigration. These policies of banishment or 'ethnic cleansing' are never called what they ultimately mean: forced migration or death. There is also no scientific basis for 'one pure race', the way ethnic purists claim. The Genome Project has verified there is only one human race, which has approximately 30,000 genes, a little more than plants (26,000 genes), much more than worms (18,000 genes), but far less than originally thought (rice has 50,000 genes).

History shows that migrants are often the convenient scapegoat for other difficulties, besides globalisation, that cannot easily be solved. eg, a police force may be corrupt and inept at solving crime. A public may know this. But if a rise in crime appears to suddenly occur - especially more crimes apparently by 'foreigners' - public attention may be diverted towards this secondary, new issue and away from the primary, older issue at hand - police corruption.

#### Migrant populations in the future

If there is grudging acceptance of foreign workers as a means to ensure the economic survival of many receiving states, there is usually great reluctance to treat them as workers with the same rights as local workers. The UN Convention for the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, passed in 1990, was ratified by enough states to come into force in 2003. However, the majority of receiving countries in both Asia and Europe have yet to recognise it. Other political initiatives have been put in place, although political will to fully address migration issues has to be considerable. Clearly, migration is not something that will go away. Many national governments have resorted to policies of avoidance or forced repatriation, expulsions, arrests, closing of gates and blatant discrimination but these have not proven to be the most effective short or long-term solutions. International and regional co-operation and commitment to address both economic and humanitarian concerns in a more equitable balance, will need to be ongoing, and more innovative.

# SOCIAL AND POLITICAL/LEGAL SUMMARY

By Dr Huang Ping and Prasopsee Sookmark

Derived from country reports by David Celdran (Philippines), Dr Mahendra Lama (South Asia/India), Dr Huang Ping (China), Dr Anek Nakabutara and Prasopsee Sookmark (Thailand), Ann Lee (Malaysia), Dr Ryu Jeong Soon (Korea) and Masataka Okamoto (Japan). With additional information from "Sex industry assuming massive proportions in Southeast Asia" (ILO Report, released 19 Aug, 1998)

#### Both cross-border and internal migration take place across Asia today.

Internal labour migration is at its highest in China and India. As for the Philippines, Thailand, Malaysia, Korea and Japan, due to the differences in the size of the countries and population, the trend for internal migration is not nearly as evident. For them, crossborder migration is the larger issue. Because of a long open and porous border and historical factors, India also receives a major chunk of migrants from the neighbouring countries.

Ongoing globalisation is triggering off fresh migration, and making migration patterns more complicated. Thus, the issue of migration deserves attention from researchers, policy makers, business and general publics.

Generally, **poverty, either caused by protracted underdevelopment or by natural disasters is the first notable re ason that causes migration,** e.g., the GDP gap between Thailand, and India and their neighbouring countries have resulted in an influx of migration into Thailand, while the regional disparity and income gaps between rural and urban areas has produced large-scale rural labour migration within China. In China, the rural labour flow into urban areas is to get higher income to provide for education of siblings, family healthcare and investment in agricultural infrastructure. In India, segments of the rural population move to urban areas in search of employment, due to poverty mainly caused by inaccessibility to resources, including land. Concerning crossborder migration, **political reasons cannot be overlooked.** To achieve cultural homogeneity and foreign policy objectives, or to deal with political dissidents and class enemies, states have often encouraged emigration. Refugees from Afghanistan, Bhutan, Myanmar and Sri Lanka are a telling example.

However the socio-economic profile of these migrants are also undergoing some visible changes. The majority of Filipino migrants are college-level graduates who are proficient in English and are recruited by overseas worker recruitment agencies to be employed as teachers, health workers and engineers in medium to highly skilled positions. Many of the Indian migrants are skilled and trained, whereas the work profile of Nepalese and Bangladeshi migrants are changing from mere domestic workers to more skill-oriented activities.

#### Reasons for acceptance of migrant workers are different.

Some countries, such as Japan, Korea and Malaysia accept immigrants mainly as skilled and unskilled workers. The economic boom in these countries required a large-scale labour force. In an attempt to increase the supply of labour, Japan has shifted its immigration policy to allow foreign nationals of Japanese descent and their families to migrate to Japan. Similarly, Korea has implemented a special system to legally facilitate the entrance of Chinese nationals of Korean descent into the country. Some countries such as Pakistan accept immigrants for political objectives. India and Nepal accept each other's people on account of 1950 Treaty that permits free reciprocal flow of people across the border. But many countries do not welcome migrants, even if they provide necessary labour for economic growth, for they are perceived as competition for limited resources such as employment opportunities, wages, housing, healthcare and education They are also increasingly considered as a burden on already stressed civic amenities and public utilities.

#### Illegal or irregular/undocumented migration is a common problem.

The irregular flow of migrants largely illegal in nature, has gained momentum in the face of strict restrictive measures applied by the host countries and also because of the mushrooming of agencies that facilitate such flows. On this issue of undocumented migration, the Philippines, India, China, Thailand and Malaysia have traditional migration routes and patterns that are still active, resulting in the influx of undocumented migrants into those countries. In India estimates given by the Home Affairs Ministry mention about 15-20 million Bangladeshi "illegal" immigrants. Thailand registered over half a million (562,527) undocumented migrant workers during one single month (September 24- October 25, 2001) mostly from Burma, Laos and Cambodia.

(In the absence of proper birth/death records, citizenship documentation and also ethnic and language affinity, it is difficult to identify migrants from citizens in many of these countries.)

On the other hand, it is more difficult to enter into Japan and Korea illegally, thus most undocumented migrants obtain tourist visas or trainee status to those countries and then either overstay their visa or flee the training organization and remain in the countries without any legal status.

#### The situation of documented migrants is similar.

The majority of these are generally from less developed areas and are employed in the "3-D" sector - dirty, dangerous and demeaning jobs - which domestic labourers are unwilling to perform. The wage discrimination is visible in all these countries. For instance in Korea, a foreign industrial trainee earns 68.3% of that of a Korean worker, although they do the same work.

#### Avoidance in addressing long term health care needs, and 'stateless' children

In general, public services provided to migrants are a burden on the receiving country and are provided for humanitarian reasons. Undocumented migrants are unwilling to access such services unless it is absolutely necessary, for fear of being identified, detained and deported. They are generally in a dilemma. For economic reasons, undocumented migrants resort to living in simple conditions, usually in overcrowded clusters. Such living conditions often become incubation areas for diseases and facilitate the emergence

of communicable diseases. The migrants may also be carriers for the re-emergence of previously eradicated diseases. It should also be noted that unlike India, which entitles citizenship to those born on Indian soil, Thailand and Malaysia do not provide children of undocumented migrants with birth certificates. As a result, those children become stateless without access to public services provided for those with birth certificates such as healthcare (vaccinations) and education. Without access to education, the children are deprived of the opportunity to improve their lives and social status. Moreover, they are unable to return to their parents' homeland because they have no proof of their parentage.

Foreign migrant workers are often discriminated by both locals and by journalists in the mass media; in this respect, it can be said that xenophobia by Asians against Asians is widespread. In the Philippines: Chinese undocumented migrants are attributed with drug trafficking and kidnapping, Indian undocumented migrants with illegal moneylending activities, and Muslim undocumented migrants as terrorists. In Thailand: undocumented migrants from Cambodia are stereotyped as beggars and kidnappers of children for beggars' props, while Burmese stereotypes are that of trafficked women and children whose human rights are abused. In addition, Burmese undocumented migrant workers are also stereotyped as very ruthless, thereby forewarning employers about their capability of killing their own employers in cold-blood. In Malaysia: Indonesian migrant workers are often portrayed as burglars and murderers, girls in sex or vice rings are usually only mainland Chinese, and Bangladeshi migrants are often portrayed as just intent to marry and carry off Malaysian women. In Japan: undocumented migrants from China are stereotyped as burglars. In India: undocumented migrants are not as clearly stereotyped due to the fact that as a multicultural and multiethnic country with very porous borders, it is almost impossible to identify the migrants. However, poor Nepali and Bangladeshi migrants are increasingly looked down upon as only fit as domestic help. In Pakistan, Afghan refugees were invariably asked to declare their political affiliations in order to be able to access public assistance, and be provided with arms to carry out their resistance activities. In China, migrant labourers are viewed as temporary migrants without any awareness of duties and responsibility to take care of urban surroundings, as they are not legal residents and do not have a sense of ownership or belonging.

**Discriminatory portrayals of migrant workers serve to upgrade nationalistic fervour in every country under survey**, except possibly China, given its occurrence of internal migration. (In this case, discrimination by urban people against people from poorer or rural regions frequently exists.)

Among undocumented migrants, *women* account for about one third of the total, particularly in China and India. The majority of women work in services, mostly in prostitution. Child prostitution is also increasing rapidly, especially in Southeast Asia. According to an International Labour Organisation (ILO) report, this kind of migrant worker occupation is assuming "massive proportions". Indeed, the rapidly growing scale of prostitution in Asia and Southeast Asia has serious implications relating to public morality, social welfare, and transmission of HIV/AIDS, criminality, and violations of the basic human rights of commercial sex workers. To date, none of the seven countries in the survey has a consistent legal stance and effective public policy or national programme to deal with prostitution and also trafficking of women in the long term. Fundamentally, although the sex sector is a commercial sector in its own right - one that contributes substantially to employment and national income in the region - it is not recognised as an economic sector in official statistics, development plans or government budgets. Only of late there are some networking by NGOs in at least sensitising governments and the people about the nature, extent and damages done by such trafficking. As a result, for the first time, South Asian countries have signed a regional convention to eliminate the trafficking of women and children for illegal purposes. Otherwise, the forced labour of women as migrant workers in this sector continues, well known but unofficially recognised. Between 5,000 and 7,000 Nepali girls are trafficked every year across the border to India. Most of them end up as sex workers in brothels in Bombay and New Delhi. An estimated 200,000 Nepali women, most of them girls under 18, work in Indian cities (estimates by *Maiti Nepal*, Child Workers in Nepal and National Commission for Women in India). Estimates in 1993/4 suggest there were between 140,000 and 230,000 prostitutes in Indonesia, between 43,000 and 142,000 in Malaysia, from 100,000 to 600,000 in the Philippines, and between 65,000 to 300,000 in Thailand. There are also tens of thousands of Thai and Filipino prostitutes working in other countries – mainly women, but also male, transvestite and children. According to a 1994 report in Asian Age, there are at least 70,000 women sex workers in Delhi, Madras, Calcutta, Bangalore and Hyderbad. 30% of these women are under 20 years of age. 40% are 20-30 years of age, and approximately 15% of them became prostitutes as children under the age of 12. The majority of these women are Dalits, or from castes which are recognised as backward under the Indian Constitution. In addition to the clients who demand and pay for the services, other occupations and businesses with links to the sex sector include doctors (who conduct health check-ups on sex workers), accountants, pimps, property owners, entertainment and refreshment outlets, government licence providers, cleaners, waitresses, and security services, special tourist agencies, and health clinics.

In total, the sex sector in the se countries is estimated to account for be tween 2-14% of their GDP. In Thailand, close to US\$300 million is transferred annually to rural families by women working in the sex sector in urban areas. For the 1993-1995 period, prostitution yielded an annual income estimated at US\$22-27 billion. In Indonesia, the financial turnover of the sex sector is estimated at US\$1.2 billion to US\$3.3 billion, or between 0.8 and 2.4% of the country's GDP, with much of prostitutes' earnings remitted from urban brothel complexes to their family villages. Most surveys within sex establishments revealed that while a significant proportion of sex workers claimed that they wanted to leave the occupation if they could, many expressed concern about the earnings they risked losing if they changed jobs. In Malaysia, earnings in the sex sector are higher relative to earnings in other types of unskilled employment. In manufacturing for instance, average wages per annum in 1990 were US\$2,852 for skilled workers, and US\$1,711 for unskilled workers. In comparison, a part-time sex worker in the cheapest of hotels who received US\$4 per client, seeing about ten clients daily and working only once a week for about 12 hours, earned US\$2,080 per annum.

The picture is incomplete however on establishments - especially brothels that harbour sex workers without their passports - and on those women and children who are victims of serious exploitation and abuse. (from '*The Sex Sector: The economic and social bases of prostitution in Southeast Asia*', ILO, 1998)

# Labour migration has widespread impacts on both the receiving countries \regions and the original countries \regions.

The problems that arise from *internal migration* are two-fold. The first problem concerns urban society in that the influx of people to the cities leads to an increase in crime, congestion, the spread of communicable diseases due to lack of information and education, and an increase in the number and size of urban slums. The second problem concerns the rural society. In the steady departures of rural labour forces, tho se that leave the rural communities could actually be necessary agricultural labour, rather than surplus urban labour. With the subsequent brain and manpower drain, the possibility of successful agriculture, and income generation from agriculture is limited, leading to a decrease in the revenues collected and a corresponding decrease in the welfare provided for agricultural communities. Thus, rural communities become dependent on remittances from internal migrants for their well-being.

As for *cross-border illegal migration*, the case is more complex. e.g., as undocumented migrants move further into Thailand or India, their presence has a more permanent orientation, resulting in the perception that they are infringing upon the rights and services of the local people and raising the spectre of traditional fears of aggression and occupation, thereby fuelling nationalistic fervour. They have sometimes become a major cause of violent local movement like that of Assam in India. Migrants make substantial contributions to the receiving countries/regions in the field of economy, culture and politics. On the other hand, the immigration causes some social, political, and legal problems in the receiving countries/regions and the original countries/regions. Though many of these governments in receiving countries have taken measures and enacted series of policies to deal with the issue of migration, the re still exists a substantial policy gap that make many of these measures inefficient and ineffective. However, undocumented immigration is not a major issue in the Philippines, as the movement of people into the country is limited and considered to be an extension of traditional movements that do not impact greatly on the social fabric of the country.

Regardless of the stereotypes and the social problems that occur as a result of the presence of undocumented migrant workers, local industries and employers are still willing to provide them with jobs, and also pressure policy makers to allow undocumented migrant workers to be provided with employment opportunities within the countries. This is because of the economic gains received from these migrant workers. At the same time, undocumented migrants continue to risk everything to work in these countries because back in their countries of origin, they are largely acclaimed by their families and birth communities, as they remit funds that alleviate their families' economic hardships. In many cases, to work in a foreign land has always remained a source of better social status.

Most of the labour-sending countries are facing similar problems. But, there has not emerged any meaningful dialogue and effective international cooperation among these countries to highlight these issues, related to both legal and irregular migrants. To a certain extent, this move has been so far thwarted by the competitive nature of labour migration. However, frequent consultation may help in ultimately generating a conscious check on irregular migrants, and also creating "a consortium of migrants" based on an analysis of skills and supply capabilities.

#### Conclusion

Although problems such as displacement, social change and even increased criminal behaviour may arise, both cross-border migration and internal migration provide benefits to the migrants, the sending countries and the receiving countries. For this reason, the general consensus amongst ALFP researchers as with a majority of academics studying migration, is that all forms of migration will remain circular, temporary and/or permanent, depending on the situation. **To a large extent, migration has become market driven. Both push and pull factors are becoming vital.** Constant repatriation exercises as 'solutions' to migration are costly and short term in effect.

The other way to address this sensitive issue is to design innovative measures and policies for both the integration of migrants and the reintegration of returnees into the local society, and to encourage local societies to be more receptive to the presence of migrants. Both 'in' and 'out' migratory populations have affected most of the countries. Therefore, awareness should be raised within local societies that undocumented migrants within their national borders, should be treated in the manner that they would like their own nationals, who are undocumented migrants in other countries, to be treated.

# ECONOMIC AND SECURITY SUMMARY

#### By Dr. Mahendra Lama

International migration in the international economic system is an old and established phenomenon. Its social and economic roles at the international level have been vital. Over the years, its nature, direction and volume have undergone significant changes. The declining cost of migration – due to advanced information and transportation networks, increasing population pressure in many labour-sending countries, the fledgling gap between the development and technological status of the countries in the North and South, the removal of political and other racial biases-related immigration restrictions in several receiving countries - have all acted as catalysts to this migratory phenomenon.

Economic implications, entailed by migration, obviously affect both host and laboursending countries. However, two factors make in-depth analysis of the Asian migration picture difficult. First, the countries of emigration (where migrants go to) are a heterogeneous group in terms of economic development and socio-cultural characteristics. Hence, impact analysis of migration is a complex task. Second, there has been a distinct lack of information systems and related statistics, both within and outside the Asian region. There is no worthwhile record of the dimension of migratory flows, return and illegal migration; no analytical studies on sectoral impact, skill composition and financial implications, except some scattered literature. A more scientific approach to assess the actual impact of migration is to use the cost-benefit analysis formula, although this is constrained by several factors, which are non-quantitative in nature. The following overview is my interpretation of the contributory and characteristic economic and security-related factors of migration in Asia.

#### **Extent of Migration**

They have been both sending and receiving migrants. In the 1950s, Chinese labour mainly flowed into South East Asia. Now the flow destinations have diversified. Moreover, the scale of mainland citizens leaving China has increased steadily. Chinese go abroad for service work, sightseeing/entertainment, meeting/business, calling on relatives and friends etc. However, those going abroad for employment only account for a minority of the total.

In Malaysia, around 1.7 million (less than 2%) million are documented foreign migrants. Undocumented foreign migrants are estimated at from 500,000 to over 1 million, including the states of Sabah and Sarawak. In Korea, there are 336,955 foreigners, approximately 1.5% of the total Korean work force. The very employment pattern of migrant workers is different and complex. For instance, in Korea, migrant workers usually work in manufacturing, construction, agriculture, fishery, and animal husbandry. In India, they are mostly in agriculture and household activities.

In 2001, the total number of foreign residents in Japan was 1.5 million (excluding people from Japan's wartime colonies and their descendants), or 1.2% of Japan's total population. The majority of foreign residents (including immigrants and migrant

workers) were from Korea (632,405), China, (381,220) and Brazil (265,960). For India, international migration has been an old practice and established phenomenon. There are 1.68 million Indians in US alone, which is the single largest destination of Indian migrant labour. (Ministry of External Affairs 2001, as quoted by ESCAP, *Dynamics of International Migration from India : Its Economic and Social Implications", August 2003*).

#### **Economic Benefits**

Out-migration has brought immense benefits to the sending countries. It should be noted that Filipino overseas workers annually remit up to a total of USD6 billion, according to the BSP (Central Bank of the Philippines). The International Monetary Fund (IMF) published a list of 20 developing countries with the volume of remittances and its percentage share of GDP. A majority of the South Asian countries figured in this, wherein India ranked as number one in terms of the volume of remittances with US \$ 11 billion, 2.6% of its GDP (IMF, *Balance of Payment Statistics*, Washington, 2000).

At the same time, countries like China and India, that have witnessed a rather high degree of migration within the country, have also gained tremendously. Labour migration from rural to urban areas have made great contributions to the development of Chinese society - e.g., it reduced the pressure of land vs. people, and contributed 16% cent of total GDP growth in the past 18 years. Various kinds of institutional boundaries have also been broken, or narrowed between rural and urban, eastern-coastal and western-central, the agricultural and industrial. Thus, the authorities in China are gradually abolishing biased policies and taking new measures to encourage or protect migrant labourers.

Benefits to the host country include loosening of labour supply bottlenecks, fuller utilization of available capital, and increase in GNP. Labour-sending countries also benefit from remittances, reduction in domestic unemployment, skill acquisition, technology and social change. In fact, for labour-sending countries, the single largest benefit has been migrants' remittances. Since most of these countries have balance of payments that are characterized by a large trade deficit, this flow of remittances has largely compensated this deficit.

#### **Direction of migration in Asia**

The directions of migration in Asia have varied both at the inter and intra-regional level. It is not only the difference in income levels, but also the level of technology, geographical proximity, political atmosphere and social conditions that determine migrations at both sub-continental and continental levels. Both economic and non-economic determinants of migration have constituted the causal factors. Skill composition has been a crucial issue in the theatre of migration. The nature of skills distribution in labour-receiving countries provides an idea of the type and level of labour that is migrating, and also the structure of scarcities and surpluses in labour- sending countries.

#### **Forced migrants/refugees – Costs**

The category of forced migrants, mainly refugees, has been of very high degree in the whole of the Asian region. There are at times very high costs of refugees to host countries. Besides the staggering cost of managing refugees, other major issues have been that of socio-economic pressures, national security and demographic imbalances. Refugees have become a 'threat' to a host country when they are i) seen as a political threat or security risk to the regime of the host country, ii) perceived as a threat to cultural identity or indigenousness and iii) considered as a social and economic burden.

There are also times when a host country uses immigrants as an instrument of threat against the country of origin. This threatens strategic security, structural dimension and regime security. While there is usually strong protest and upheavals, there are also new challenges emerging, in terms of concepts like 'hidden losers', 'compassion and aid fatigue'.

#### Labour-sending countries – difficulties

However, labour-sending countries must deal with such issues as the impermanent nature of favourable remittance flows, flows through illegal channels, and use of remittances in non-essential consumer items, when the focus has largely been to maximise remittances and channel them to productive investments. Indeed, the apparent consumption pattern of return migrants with a concentration on durable and non-durable goods, along with inelastic supply positions of these goods indigenously, has often caused both inflation and a sub-optional import structure for a labour-sending country. This consumerist trend is said to have caused a chain of social disorders.

Labour-sending countries have remained a passive body in the face of strict restrictive measures applied by host countries to confine migration to a demand- determined level. This vulnerability adds to the difficulty in absorbing the return migrants.

Migrants' central questions, while working abroad, are usually their integration and acculturation in the cultural, social and economic environments of sometime-hostile host countries. The generally poor working conditions, absence of trade union rights, social hazards, deskilling effects, deprivation of both civil and political rights, discrimination in wage levels on the grounds of nationality, education, wealth, occupational skills, language or familial relations are just some intricate issues which are yet to exercise the minds of most labour-sending countries.

#### False hopes and returnees

The belief that emigrants would acquire much-needed industrial skills is largely unfounded. Except in few cases, most of them have suffered from the "skimming effect" of emigration: returnees have experienced tremendous physical and mental pressures while away, without involving any occupational up-gradation. Some labour-sending countries have suffered increasing shortages of particular skills, because of their exodus. How labour-sending countries are coping with this situation, and to what extent host countries have saved the cost of producing such skills, needs special attention. For the reabsorption of return migrants who have actually acquired new skills, labour-sending country governments must facilitate the import of their tools, and the skill with which they were attached in the foreign country.

#### Migration private and public agencies

A new structural feature, in the present phase of migration, has been the organization of migrant recruitment by private agents. Their package deals, to make the migration process easier, many times ignored a major fall out, i.e. the minimal increase in wages of contract workers even during the Middle-East boom period, and a substantial drop in wages during the decline in work force demand.

The abuse of migrant labour force in some host countries has forced governments to effectively intervene. This has been done by arranging public recruiting agencies, and by strictly regulating the outflow of labour migrants.

For host countries, government intervention is still limited to ensuring that terms and conditions of employment conform to specified minimum norms. But the large part of manpower export is still handled by exploitative private agencies. A strong need to manage, plan and canalize manpower experts by governments, on the line done by China and Korea, is called for.

In most cases the host countries' policies are evolved not as a function of clearly defined long term objectives, but as short term responses to a particular economic and political situation. This uncertainty has kept labour-sending countries at the dictates of the host.

#### Legal Provisions

As migration of their citizens become so crucial to their economic earnings, these countries have put in place legal frameworks to regulate and institutionalise the migration process. Interestingly, these countries are becoming stricter on the issue of in-migration and are turning out to be a hostile host, while consciously encouraging out-migration with generous support mechanisms.

In Japan, the Immigration Control Act sets laws and the legal status for migrant workers, and according to a new law in 1995, introduced by the Ministry of Labour, recruiting companies and migrant workers must sign contracts. Working conditions such as wage, trainee period, method of payment, tax, medical insurance should be stated on the standard contract.

The Japanese government revised the Immigration Control Act again in 1998, and added the "crime of unlawful stay" to the code, which took effect in February 2000. To 'protect the country's interests', the Japanese government persists in not allowing unskilled foreign workers into Japan, and is thus unwilling to take political measures to protect rights of immigrants and migrant workers.

The Philippines government is committed to providing support for Filipinos by obtaining employment overseas through education policies that provide skills in demand in destination countries, and by establishing legal, economic and psychological mechanisms.

In addition, support mechanisms have been established to assist migrants because they repatriate huge amounts of money, pay taxes and represent a large political force. A primary responsibility of Philippines embassies is to support Filipino migrants overseas.

To administer cross-border migration, the Chinese government has enacted and implemented some policies and set up organizations for migration management at state and local levels. But there are still many illegal emigrants.

Malaysia has a well-developed infrastructure to accept documented migrants, with specific guidelines regarding employment categories, work permits, including legislation for employers and also migrant worker compensation/insurance. Government regulations are also used to restrict employment of foreign migrant workers, allowing only nationals of specific countries, such as Indonesia, Bangladesh, Pakistan, the Philippines and Thailand to be employed in sectors such construction, plantation, service (as domestic servants, hotel industry, trainers and instructors) and manufacturing. Recent changes have expanded the formal government-to-government recruitment channels for employment of workers to include Cambodia, Myanmar (Burma), Nepal, Laos, Vietnam, India, Turkmenistan, Uzbekistan and Kazakhstan.

The Thai Government earlier regularly resorted to repatriation of undocumented migrants. Now it is implementing measures for temporary registration of undocumented migrant workers for various occupations, with a certain set of occupations reserved for Thais. One current policy to be pursued is the establishment of an 'economic dam' in the border areas with Myanmar, Cambodia, and Laos. This is to provide economic opportunities for concerned parties in economic zones along the borders, so that undocumented migrants can remain in the border areas rather than entering into the country, while maintaining the pace of Thai economic growth.

Malaysia has a 'special relationship' with Indonesia for the employment of migrant labour, through officially recognized paths of entry as well as traditional routes.

Some of these practices have also led to serious diplomatic imbroglios. Malaysia and the Philippines as well as India and Bangladesh are some interesting examples of such diplomatic spats.

In India a two pronged strategy has now been in vogue to minimize the aspects of irregularity in migration and exploitation of migrants by these agencies. Firstly, there have been attempts to set up public recruiting agencies which select, regulate and monitor a majority of migrants. Secondly, the government has clamped down strict regulatory measures by means of direct intervention through mandatory guarantee deposits for migrant workers' safety and other conditions.

#### **Future needs**

Emigration-related skill and man-power loss, the weakening of the regional economic structure, inflation and the diversion of productive resources into consumption-oriented investment are all now debatable issues in labour-sending countries, which is a good sign.

However, only long term-based increased cooperation between labour-sending and host countries can ensure more rational utilization of human resources. A strong need to exercise control at both ends already exists. Both the right to emigrate and immigration should be equally recognized, and worldwide growing interdependence needs to be recognized more explicitly.

## MEDIA SURVEY – TOP FINDINGS & RECOMMENDATIONS By David Celdran

#### Background

Increased mobility and the need for cheap labour have increased the number of migrants making new homes for themselves across Asia. In spite of this, the cultural and geographic distance – the differences in colour, faith and language, and biases formed over the centuries – remain. The presence of foreigners that we come into contact may continue to grow and challenge our image of foreigners. But in no other way has our awareness of migrants been enlarged than by that we read, listen and watch in the media. It's an inescapable cycle: the images we consume shape the opinions that influence public policy that in turn affects the migrant societies among us.

In October 2001, fellows of the Asia Leaders Fellowship Program embarked on a research that included as one of its components a research on the relationship between public attitudes, government policies and media coverage on foreign migrants. It was our belief then, as it is even more so now after concluding the research, that media, public opinion, government policy- making and the conditions and treatment of migrants are all spokes of a single wheel that could be influenced – positively - through a more informed, sensitive and responsible media environment.

#### Methodology and scope of coverage

- The study was conducted between January 2002 and March 2004 and covered 775 news stories and opinion pieces about issues concerning transborder migrants culled from market-leading newspapers, news magazines, television news programs and news websites across the seven Asian countries covered by the ALFP report: China, India, Japan, Korea, Mala ysia, Philippines and Thailand. Radio was largely not covered because of difficulty in retrieving archival material.
- The stories were subjected to a content analysis by each country researcher. Stories chosen were reports pertaining to transborder migrants of Asian origin (excluding Middle East) as defined by the larger ALFP study. Only inbound migrants or foreign migrants already living and working in the host countries were covered by the study.
- 3. Mainstream media organizations with nation-wide circulation and viewership were chosen to ensure that the news articles and reports covered in the study have a higher probability of having been seen or read by policy makers and the general public.
- 4. Private interviews with journalists occupying senior or positions of responsibility were conducted to determine the nature of their organization's coverage and the manpower and financial resources that are available for covering transborder migration. A total of 19 senior reporters, editors and news executives were

interviewed in 2003 across the seven participating Asian countries. In organizations with strict privacy and non-disclosure policies, sources were interviewed off the record or asked our researchers to keep their identities anonymous.

#### Breakdown of media organizations by country covered by the ALFP study:

Table 1.

	China	India	Japan	Korea	Malaysia	Philippines	Thailand
PRINT	Peoples Daily	Hindustan Times	Yomiuri Shimbun	Chosen Ilbo	Berita Harian	Philippine Daily	Thai Rath
	Online China Youth Daily	Outlook The Hindu India Today The Statesman Frontline Navbharat Times	Sankei Shimbun Mainichi Shimbun Ryukyu Shimpo	Joongang Ilbo Hankyurae Shinmoon	(The Star) (New Straits Times)	Inquirer Philippine Star Manila Standard	
TV	CCTV		KBS	KBS MBC	TV 3	ABS-CBN Ch.2	Bangkok Broad- Casting and TV Ch.7
INTERNET					Malaysia kini.com The Star Online	INQ 7.net	

#### FINDINGS

	Crime	Illegal Entry/ Trafficking	Labour Issues/ Policies	Terrorism	Immigration Policy/Cross- border Disputes	Others
Country (no. of stories)						
China (45)		10	23		12	
India (25)	3	4		7	11	
Japan (395)	104	91	91		109	
Malaysia (37)	5	11	2		18	1
Philippines (37)	14	9		12		2
Thailand (23)	2	6		5	10	
Korea (213)		71*	71*		71*	
TOTAL (380)	128	202	187	24	231	3

Table 2: Top Themes of media coverage of transborder migrants broken down by country.

\* Stories broken down equally since reports covered multiple themes

The content analysis reveals that there were 5 recurring themes under which issues of transborder migrants were framed and covered in the news. Although these issues are interrelated and often appear side-by-side in a single story, the dominant themes can be broken down as:

- (1) immigration policy in relation to cross-border tensions,
- (2) international terrorism,
- (2) labour and living conditions of migrants,
- (3) human trafficking and the illegal entry of aliens,
- (4) criminal activities, and
- (5) other human interest and light features done on immigrant groups in their host countries.

Our findings show that each country has a particular theme that emerges more dominant than the others. This, of course, depends on social, political and economic conditions unique to the host country and the way migrant populations play into this mix of conditions. For example, the preponderance of terrorism-related stories in the Philippines, India and Thailand reflect the security conditions in these countries and the perceived threat posed by migrants (usually Islamic) on the local population.

In countries like Korea and Malaysia, which rely on foreign workers for cheap and unskilled labour, the dominant themes are that of government policies on immigration, migrant labour and the campaign to crackdown on illegal workers and human trafficking. Media coverage of issues, concerning migrant labour and the government's policy toward it, is proportionately the most intense in Japan where a national debate on whether the country should encourage foreign workers to supplement its aging workforce is being fueled by ongoing negotiations on international trade agreements with other Asian nations.

For India and Thailand, which are bordered by poorer neighbours with large amounts of migrant labourers spilling in, media coverage is also largely centred around immigration polices, particularly those that have to do with curbing illegal labour.

The theme of criminal activity, related to migrant groups, cuts across most countries regardless of their economic level of development, but with Japan showing proportionately the most media attention given to this phenomenon. In the Philippines, crimes committed to and by foreign migrants (i.e. Chinese) make up the highest proportion of news reports on migrants in general.

The research shows that although news stories involving transborder migrants carry a dominant theme, majority of these stories actually cover more than one theme. National immigration policy for example is often discussed in relation to the influx of illegal migrant workers and criminal activity associated with these minority groups.

Aside from dominant themes traced from the news stories collected, the research was also able to determine the following.

# 1. Sourcing of stories for transborder migrants is largely based on the perspective of government authorities. Migrants themselves are under-represented as sources of news stories about them.

Only three stories out of the total 775 had migrants themselves interviewed. For all stories, government officials, immigration and police authorities are the primary and often the single source of information. This is especially true for state-owned and controlled media like those found in China, Thailand and Malaysia, but is also common in privately owned media organizations and in countries with a traditionally free press.

#### 2. Stories covering transborder migrants tend towards negative themes.

As the table shows, dominant themes about migrants relate to crime, human trafficking, illegal labour and terrorism. The stories that report on immigration policy are largely in relation to curbing the threat of illegal migrants to national and job security.

A minority of the reports provide a more intimate look at the identities and culture of migrant populations, or their successful integration within host countries. Even in cases where news reports take on a sympathetic bias towards their migrant subjects, these are usually presented in relation to the victimization of migrants by criminal syndicates and government officials. It should be emphasized, however, that there have been attempts to personalize the plight of migrant workers through news reports and programs such as those found in the research on Korean and Japanese television news. 3. Stories on transborder migrants incorporate nationalist or populist perspectives that reinforce international tensions and racial differences.

The stories collected show an overwhelming tendency for reports to be written from a nationalist perspective. The tendency to frame issues in the 'us' versus 'them' dichotomy is reinforced by sourcing information from government authorities exclusively, as well as the tendency to align stories with the prevailing popular mood towards migrants at that moment. Countries with strong anti-immigrant traditions show a proportionate amount of negative reporting on foreign migrants, while countries that are more open provide a more fair and even sympathetic tone of coverage.

#### 4. Issues on transborder migrants are under-covered in mainstream media.

The interviews with journalists tell us that the coverage of foreign migrants is on an ad-hoc basis (i. e. stories are developed only when crises involving migrants are reported) and therefore occupy a lower priority in daily news gathering and reporting. In the Japanese experience, reports on illegal migrant workers were merely a consequence of a national debate on trade agreements with Asian neighbours. If and when migrants are covered under the subject matter of labour policy, they are often treated as "nameless and faceless" subjects in relation to larger economic arguments presented within reports. Critical issues affecting migrants like human rights, living conditions, and HIV/AIDS for example were marginally covered in the stories collected.

# 5. News organizations lack the skills and resources to cover transborder migration comprehensively.

The issues of transborder migration are as complex as they are difficult to report on. Our interviews show that none of the media organizations covered assign a beat or manpower and financial resources exclusively for covering news about migrants. Neither is any specialized training made available to those journalists covering migration. The interviews also tell us that the geographical and cultural inaccessibility of migrant populations discourages them from giving more attention and media space. Reaching out to these populations entails a substantial investment that is not readily available.

The above findings are general conclusions based only on the study conducted. It should however be said that, while they point to a media environment that is unfavourable to migrant populations, there are, within each country covered in this study, media organizations and journalists, albeit in the minority, that consciously try to broaden or improve their coverage of foreign migrants.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS

Most of the journalists interviewed believe that transborder migration is, or will increasingly be, a defining issue of the 21<sup>st</sup> century. The globalization of capital, labour and terror all point to the growing importance that news organizations must give to issues concerning migrants, but steps need to be taken in order to deepen awareness among

journalists and re-orient newsrooms in order to cover migration in a more balanced, culturally sensitive and comprehensive manner.

The following recommendations were selected by the interviewed journalists and media executives:

- 1. Reorient editorial judgment and realign newsroom resources:
  - a. Establish beat/ reorient existing beats
  - b. Provide adequate training (politics and culture of migrant societies, migration studies, statistics)
  - c. Improve and expand sourcing to include affected migrants, NGOs, academia, foreign diplomats and labour attaches
  - d. Invest in special reports and human interest reports on migrants
- 2. Establish Regional and International coordination and information sharing among news organizations
  - a. Establish sources from sending countries
  - b. Database sharing

# **MEDIA SUMMARY – CHINA**

10/2002-3/2003 Supervised by Dr Huang Ping, and assistant, Liaojin

#### Abstract

Three most influential media from their type were selected: China Central Television (TV), People's Daily Online (network), China Youth Daily (newspaper), and the period of focus was from Oct. 2002 to Mar. 2003. First, the frequency of concerned articles in the media was numbered. Then, editors were interviewed for their perspectives. It was learned that the migration issues were not much thought of, in all these media, no matter whether cross-border migration or internal migration. Editors answered that ignorance of journalists, and specific editorial policies answered a big part. In general, when the media are covering internal migration, all take on a positive stance, and when covering cross-migration, a more objective position, without comment or analysis, is normally hold.

#### **China Youth Daily**

China Youth Daily (CYD) is one of the most influential newspapers in contemporary China with a circulation of 800,000 (readership, which is much more, is not officially recorded). A market research report by China Statistical Bureau ranks CYD in third place on the reading rate among the national daily papers. CYD is an all-round daily paper, which features a young profile - among the readers, 65% are aged below 35 years old. The tenet of the CYD is to meet youth requirements. CYD has seven news versions and a supplement every day, and reports domestic and foreign news involving the economy, social, educational, science and technology, culture, and sports.

During the six-month from Oct. 2002 to Mar. 2003, there were a total of 22 articles on migration: 11 articles on emigrants, including 3 articles on Chinese emigrants abroad, and 8 articles on overseas migration policy; 8 articles on internal migration; 3 articles on stowaways. It was learned that news on emigrants plays a big part in all the migration issues. The reason is that CYD is targeted towards youth, and nowadays in China, with the open and reform policy, to study or work abroad is a youth fad.

When covering the oversea migration policy, the paper provides long spaces to make objective analysis, and some of them give suggestions to readers that want to emigrate. These oversea countries were mainly New Zealand, Australia, and Canada. In interviews with emigrants abroad, 2 out of 3 articles are negative, and 1 is objective. Paper shows sympathy to their misfortunes and analyses the reasons.

As for the 8 articles on internal migration, all of them are positive. The editor said that they must stand in the same stance with the State on this issue. Internal migration matters are advocated by the State and they mobilize every resource to accomplish this, including the media. (Including the other media in this survey, CCTV and People Daily Online.)

When reporting the stowaway issues, the CYD had no special journalists on it, but repeated the news from other media. The reports were normally short and objective, just like a bulletin: stating the process, with no complaint or analysis. When asked the reason, an editor said their editorial policy is "inadvisable to report more on this issue."

In sum, China Youth Daily has bright features and an optimistic orientation: to meet youthful taste and attract them, on the migration issue, to what they care about - foreign policies on migration. There is also a standing column "Study Abroad", which intends to educate readers by it. As regards internal migration and illegal cross-border migration, the paper normally puts them in the "social-economy column". The CYD has no special journalists for migration issues, except for "Study Abroad", and no training on migration is provided.

#### **Peoples Daily Online**

People's Daily Online (PDO) is the most influential and authoritative newspaper in China, published since June 1948 and a current circulation of 3 million. According to UNESCO, it takes its place among the world top 10. People's Daily Online Chinese Edition releases news are around the clock with a daily updating of 3,000 news pieces in 12 channels - Politics, International, Opinion, Economics, Socio-Education, Society, IT, Environment, Military Affairs, Entertainment, Life and Photo - released in more than 1,800 special news topics and over 300 columns under 50 categories to show a far greater daily releasing capacity than its paternal paper, People's Daily.

From October 2002 to March 2003, there were 20 articles on migration issue: 12 articles on internal migration; 8 articles on cross-border migration including 2 articles on Hong Kong migration policy and 6 articles on stowaways. It is worth mentioning that nearly all the PDO stories on the stowaway issue are from a perspective of praising the policemen involved.

When asked how important the migration issue is, the answer was "it depends on how important the government thinks this issue is". The PDO takes a positive position when covering this kind of issue, and indeed, wants "to show a nice face to readers even when the case is wicked".

#### **China Central Television**

China Central Television (CCTV) is the national television station of the People's Republic of China. CCTV features 11 channels with a daily airtime of more than 200 hours. The programs include news, economics, the arts, opera, music, sport, movies, military affairs, science and technology, agriculture and programs for children, which appear in 300 time-slots. CCTV attracts more than 1 billion viewers, with coverage of 90.3% of the population in China. It plays an important role in education, information dissemination, culture, entertainment, and social services, just as it's self-introduction says:"The Central Television is the important public opinion organization, is the party, the government and people's important mouthpiece, is the Chinese important thought culture position, is the news display,

#### the social education, the cultural entertainment, the information service, is the main channel national public gains information, and also is the important window on the Chinese understanding the world and the way the world understands Chinese.

From October 2002 to March 2003, CCTV had much less reports on migration issues than the above two. There are 6 articles: 3 articles on internal migration; 3 articles on cross migration, including: 1 article on Hong Kong migration policy, 1 article on stowaways, and 1 on international policy. One thing that caught our eyes is that there are no reports on stowaways from mainland China mainland, only one case on Hong Kong. Yet there were 3 articles on China Youth Daily and 5 articles on the People's Daily Online at the same time.

On covering internal migration, CCTV's reports are more like literature than just news, full of praise words. As to cross-border migration issues, there are only a few words, keeping to the objective. This can be understood in the light of CCTV as "the party, the government and people's important mouthpiece".

Contents	Internal	Cross-border	Total		
	Migration		pieces		
Sub- Contents	Ecology, helping the poor, Three Gorges - migration	Chinese- emigrants in abroad	Migration policy	Stowaway cases	
China	8(P)	3(2N; 1	8(P)	3(0)	22
Youth		P)			
Daily					
People's	12(P)		2(O)	6(P)	20
Daily					
Online					
CCTV	3(P)		2(O)	1(O)-Hong	6
				Kong	

#### Summary

(Stance: positive: P, objective: O, negative: N)

## **MEDIA SUMMARY – INDIA**

Supervised Dr Mahendra Lama, with interviews conducted by Tennyson Mao

#### List of Editors and Directors interviewed

- Mr. Vinod Sharma Chief of Bureau (Political), *The Hindustan Times* The Hindustan Times Ltd. 18-20, Kasturba Gandhi Marg. New Delhi -110001.
- Mr. Harish Khare Associate Editor, *The Hindu* I.N.S. Building Rafi Marg. New Delhi -110001.
- 3.Mr. Madhusudan Anand Senior Editor (Views) & Chief of Bureau, Nav Bharat Times Bennett, Coleman & Co. Ltd. 7, Bahadurshah Zafar Marg New Delhi -110002
- Miss. Nasima Khan Assistant Editor, *India Today* F-14/15, Connaught Place, New Delhi -110001.
- Mr. V. Sudarshan Senior Analyst, *Outlook*.
   A-B 10, S.J Enclave. New Delhi - 110029.
- Mrs. Patralekha Chatterjee
   234 Aravalli Apartments,
   Alakenanda DDA flats, New Delhi -110048.

#### Vinod Sharma: Chief of Bureau (P) - The Hindustan Times

The trans-border migration issue, especially on Ba ngladeshi migration has been very adequately covered in the print and electronic media as it is "linked to security situation in the North East" says, Mr. Vinod. He further explained how illegal migrants threaten the security of the country (the problem of cross-border terrorism and other related activities) and it has become a "major political debate" in India. Although *Hindustan Times* gives adequate coverage to trans-border migration issue, it did not have any specific trained reporter assign to cover the issues. The general assignment reports whenever a crisis or issues come up, and sometimes they do hire foreign journalists to report from within their country (Bangladeshi reports on migration problems between India and Bangladesh). Mr. Vinod admits seniority and experienced reporters were not considered while highlighting the news. The basic criteria they look for is the facts and a balanced view of the News. He is of the view that, like other issues, the trans-border migration issue is often politicized, leading reporters to report based on "national interest", giving a wrong version to the stories. Thus, the core socio-economic issues are ignored and not adequately highlighted.

Mr. Vinod observes that all illegal migrants are necessarily linked to a security threat as many times, people migrate due to socio-economic and cultural affinity. Therefore, the need to show sensitivity to the human dimension of the issue while reporting trans-border migration issues, were strongly emphasised. He also felt the need to have stronger and more forceful laws to tackle various serious human problems. Lastly, he asked the International agencies and NGOs dealing with the related issues, to create awareness, educate the people and make the government more sensitive to problems. (*Friday: 10 October 2003, Time 2:30 p.m.*)

#### V. Sudarshan: Senior Analyst – Outlook

"As and when it comes up in the news environment, and a report is desired," says Sudarshan. This is done when trans-border migration becomes a burning issue or when it becomes a political debate and crisis. His organization neither has any specific and specialized reporters on the issues nor has "any water-tight guideline and policies." They examine migration issue that arise in the News environment and react to the News environment. *Outlook* does hire foreign reporters to report incidents or stories from within their country (whether it be in Britain, Sri Lanka, Bangladesh and elsewhere), whenever the issue comes up.

Sudarshan admits that the "realistic obstacles" his organization faces in reporting the migration issue is the "time factor", which means that the *Outlook*, being a Weekly Magazine, sometimes cannot highlight an incident in time, due to the time gap in their circulation. Trans-border migrations take place in South Asia mainly in search of job opportunities. Thus, he does not foresee any major problem being created by migrants in the region, except changing the demographic profile of the region. Nevertheless, he felt laws on migration in India are not adequate to tackle the problems, but at the same time he does not know whether creating more laws, or implementation of the existing laws, will solve the problems. (*Wednesday: 15 October 2003, Time - 12: 50 Noon.*)

#### Harish Khare: Associate Editor - The Hindu

Khare admits that his paper takes note of migration issues, only when any incident or problem occurred. As a result, *The Hindu* does not have any reporters regularly reporting on the issue, though the sensitivity of reporters and their professional competency is taken into account. Their staff reporters, stationed in different parts of the region, usually send news. Khare pointed out many practical difficulties that his reporters face to cover the trans-border migration issue - like unfamiliarity of terrain, ethnic composition, language barrier and inaccessibility to interior places. Like many social analysts, writers and scholars, Khare also pointed out that migration takes place mainly due to economic problems. Further, he stated economic migrants are a continuous process, "part of daily drama, human tragedy" which has led to social unrest in some parts of the country (for example, the development of antagonism between locals and migrants for fear of economic and job deprivation by the local people).

As an analyst and editor, Khare also felt that India as a nation does not have adequate policies and sufficient laws to deal with trans-border migration problems. Yet, he explains that there could not be any definite policies on migration. The only national

policy that a country can adopt, according to him, is to prevent people from crossing the border, but at the same time he said, this could not necessarily be a common solution. (*Friday: 17 October 2003, Time: 12.00 Noon.*)

#### Nasima Khan: Assistant Editor - India Today

The problems of trans-border migration could not be ignored, says Nasima, due to large number of Indian migrants living abroad. She stated that her magazine does not often cover trans-border migration issues, but they do cover stories whenever the issue of migration comes up, especially when migrants' human rights are violated. However, stories of crimes and terrorist-related activities take center stage. *India Today* covers trans-border migration issues by reporters stationed in different parts of the region. This is mostly done through collection of news from reliable sources (news agencies), interviews with people and government officials for clear and accurate stories. *India Today* has reporters who are experts in one field or the other, and these people monitor already-made analyses and comments on different social and political issues. Sometimes, they do hire foreign reporters to report on incidents from within their country, whenever the issue comes up.

Nasima stated that inaccessibility for reporters to some parts of the country (where transborder migration usually took place) make them unable to provide accurate information of the issue. She believes trans-border migrations mostly take place due to economic factors (though a few cases of terrorist-related activities are reported). As a result of huge migration, the local people felt insecure and developed resentment towards the migrants. (*Friday: 17 October 2003, Time: 1:10 pm.*)

#### Madhusudan Anand: Senior Editor (Views) & Chief of Bureau - NAVBHARAT TIMES

Not all papers give adequate coverage to Trans-border migration issue, as is the case with *NAVBHARAT TIMES*. Anand stated that his paper been a city-centric newspaper (which mainly concentrates on city readers) which gave first priority to local news. Trans-border migration stories are brought out only when they felt it is of international and national importance. Like many other papers, it does not have any special correspondent to cover the stories of Trans-border migration. Whatever news published was usually collected from the News agencies, and the majority of stories is crime-oriented. However, they also focus on social problems and political issues. Anand says, though his paper gives very little coverage to migration issues, it gave adequate focus on the human issue like living conditions, problems of employment, health etc. He added that while reporting migration issues, the factor of human rights should be taken care of. He is also of the view that print and electronic media play an important role in pressuring policy makers to adopt effective steps in solving many social problems, including migration.

Migration is stated to have taken place in Asia due to complexity of socio-economic and religious problems within the region. And these migrants in turn, to some extent, created social unrest in different parts of the country (LTTE in Tamil Nadu, and Bangladeshi in the North East etc.) However, the most serious social problems that evolve, as a consequence of migration is the antagonism that develops between locals and the

migrants. Anand is of the view that India has enough laws to deal with migration issues but although migration may be illegal, he said, "We have to be sympathetic to them". (*Tuesday: 21 October 2003, Time - 3: 15 p.m.*)

#### Patralekha Chatterjee: Writer and Development Consultant,

Patralekha is an expert on migration and refugees problems. She writes extensively and works in various national and international agencies as reporter, consultant and adviser. She said that "migration is very important and a major issue, especially in Asia" due to its linkages to many other important social issues like HIV and AIDS. But as far as the story of migration in the media is concerned, she categorically stated that media is "event-centric" (media brings out/reflects what is going around). Migration issues therefore come into limelight only when crime and other related problems are involved. Thus, as a writer she felt the linkages of migration with other issue (serious health challenges like HIV/AIDS) are not adequately highlighted.

She pointed out that there is no such a "migration beat" in the Indian media, therefore, migration issues are covered by general assignment reporters, who deal with many other issues and news. She felt some specialization is necessary for the journalists to look deeper into the issues. According to her, one of the fundamental problems that journalists and reporters face is the allocation of shoestring budgets for their work. She opined that this has hindered them to freely move around and do field surveys. The causes of transborder migration in Asia was stated to be due to a combination of factors, like economics, human rights violations and natural calamities; she explained these by saying that, especially in Asia, most of the people migrate in search of jobs and employment opportunities. At the same time, people also migrate out of their place due to ethnic riots (Kashmiris Pandit, Hindus in Bangladesh) while some migrate because of natural calamities like drought and floods. Patralekha does not agree with the view that migration had let to social unrest in India. She said that laws would not solve the problems but a system to tackle the issues has to be implemented. (*Thursday: 6 November 2003, Time: 1: 15 p.m.*)

# **MEDIA SUMMARY - JAPAN**

By Asato Wako

#### I. Preface

This report analyzes the way media covers the transnational migrant issue in Japan. Of late, the Japanese government, as reported in the media, has been grappling with the migrant worker issue. On one hand, it has looked at the issue positively by considering the employment of more migrant workers to remedy the country's simultaneous rapid increase in the number of its aged citizens and the decrease in the number of its children. The government indeed recognizes the need for Japan to have more migrant workers to maintain its current economic level. For example, the Second Basic Plan for Immigration Control, issued by the Ministry of Justice in 2000, mentions Japan's need to accept foreign workers particularly in the care giving sector.

The Ministry of Labour and Welfare has also published a report on foreign employees in July 2000 suggesting that Japan modifies its foreign labour policy to fit globalization standards, in as much as it lacks human capital for both labour power and global competition. This sentiment is currently being echoed by the private sector in urging the government to introduce more foreign workers. Specifically, the *Keidanren*, or Federation of Economic Organizations has just come up with a report entitled "Suggestions on the Introduction of Foreign Workers" (April 2004). The paper argues that due to its changing demographic structure, Japan should increase its transnational migrant power, in order to produce higher economic value. It further suggests the establishment of a "Ministry of Multi-Cultural Society" in anticipation of the needs of people with different ethnic backgrounds converging in one society. The introduction of foreign workers has further become a current hot issue in the nation, after the media has disclosed that some Asian nations have demanded Japan's acceptance of foreign caregivers and nurses as committed during the Free Trade Agreement (FTA) negotiations.

On the other hand, the government is also aware of the negative impact of these transnational migrants in Japanese society, particularly the increase in the number of crimes committed by these foreign nationals, as reported in the media. *The Police White Paper*, published by the Metropolitan Police Department in 2003 devotes 123 pages on organized crimes committed by foreign nationals in the country. The paper emphasizes the increase in the number of crimes, especially serious criminal offences and, at the same time, it also warns that more crimes by foreigners have become organized (3.3 times higher in ratio than organized crimes by Japanese). In reaction, the government has launched a plan to eliminate half of the undocumented people in Japan, whose number has increased to about 125,000 within the past five years, since these undocumented foreign nationals are reportedly a hotbed for criminals.

The following is an analysis of the media coverage of the transnational migration issue in Japan by considering pertinent news on the following: the Free Trade Agreement (FTA); the increase in the number of crimes committed by foreign residents; and the granting of special permits to foreign nationals.

## II. Print Media (Newspaper) Coverage

The following three major national newspapers, with their respective circulation figures as of the first half of 2003, have been selected for evaluation of their newspaper articles on the transnational migration issue: *Sankei Shimbun* at 2,058,363 copies; *Yomiuri Shimbun* at 10,077,410 copies; and *Mainichi Shimbun* at 3,957,410 copies. The se figures are based on a survey done by the Audit Bureau of Circulation organization. In addition, *Sankei* is reputed to be rightwing, *Mainichi* leftwing, and *Yomiuri Shimbun* relatively in the middle. As shown in the table below, *Mainichi Shimbun* has published the most news articles on the migrant worker issue while *Sankei Shimbun* has come out with less than half of those of *Yomiuri* or *Mainichi Shimbun*.

As mentioned earlier, analysis on news media will focus on the Free Trade Agreement, and on the increase in the number of crimes committed by transnational migrants. The FTA is intertwined with the migrant worker issue, since a major deliberation on the FTA involves the introduction - or not - of non-skilled migrant workers in Japan, the answer of which will necessary make key changes in the country's immigration policy.

Number of articles on transnational migration published in three nationwide newspapers in the first three months of 2004

	Sankei Shimbun	Yomiuri Shimbun	Mainichi Shimbun
Total number of articles	33	115	125
on transnational migrants			
Number of articles on	15	51	38
crimes committed by			
transnational migrants			
Number of articles on	2	5	11
Burmese refugee			

## **1. Free Trade Agreement**

Currently, the FTA or Free Trade Agreement is widely discussed in Japan. The FTA has come to be regarded as a symbol of globalization, aiming to make trade and investment more open, by reducing tariff and non tariff barriers, in order to push the economy up by the efficient distribution of economic resources. So far, the FTA that has been tentatively forged between Japan and the Southeast Asian countries includes labour power represented by caregivers, masseurs and household workers from Thailand, and nurses, caregivers and babysitters from the Philippines. However, according to the Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry, since it is the Japanese Government's policy not to accept non-skilled workers, the Ministry of Justice is reluctant to formalize the FTA, saying that a nationwide consensus is first needed before its approval (*Mainichi Shimbun* 2004, February 6). Nevertheless, the Japanese Government is, at the same time, pressured to honour its own global agreements—enough to start reconsidering its policy on non-skilled workers—because the "FTA is the world's current movement"(*Yomiuri Shimbun* 2004, January 6).

As gleaned from the published articles, the media has covered the FTA issue positively, urging the government to make maximum efforts in forging global trade agreements. So far, few have raised questions against the FTA. This generally positive reception of the FTA is demonstrated by the three nationwide newspapers considered in this report, which are commonly regarded as occupying opposite ends of the political/editorial spectrum. Regardless of differences in editorial policies, these three are all in favour of the FTA, willing to enforce structural changes in agriculture and in the labour market, by lowering tariff rate and by opening the labour market to foreign workers. They differ, however, in their reasons for approving the FTA, specifically in connection with the acceptance of non-skilled migrant workers.

Even though *Yomiuri Shimbun* and *Sankei Shimbun* are in favour of opening the labour market for Filipino and Thai workers, this is not so out of consideration of the needs of these foreign workers, but mainly in order to make Japan more globally competitive. For instance, an editorial article mentions that the delay in the FTA with partner ASEAN members will obstruct trade. This will work negatively on stable economic development in the future, since ASEAN is the second biggest trade partner followed by the United States (*Yomiuri Shimbun* 2003, December 12, 2004, February 16, *Sankei Shimbun* 2004, April 15, 17, *Mainichi Shimbun* 2003, December 13). *Sankei Simbun* also criticizes, in an editorial, the fact that although Japan has been cultivating strong ties with the ASEAN since the post-war period, as war compensation for World War II, its economic assistance, investment and the current government's commitment to ASEAN seems less active vis-à-vis that of China, which has been getting stronger (*Sankei Shimbun* December 12). It further opines that if Japan wants to cement stronger ties with ASEAN, the government should take a more aggressive and ingenious FTA strategy with the former.

These two newspapers each criticize what they perceive as government inaction toward FTA negotiations, accusing some ministry and diet members of protecting their own vested interests; thus, their refusal to create changes (*Yomiuri Shimbun* 2003, December 12). Furthermore, both point out that one constraint in FTA negotiations is the deliberate non-cooperation and non-coordination of ministries and diet members opposed to the FTA, in order to protect agriculture and the status quo. The *Sankei Shimbun* refers to the non-coordination among and between government agencies as a major factor in the delay of FTA negotiations (2004, March 13).

While, on one hand, *Yomiuri Shimbun* and *Sankei Shimbun* emphasize the need for FTA as a matter of national interest; *Mainichi Shimbun*, on the other hand, looks at FTA as a means of dealing with the migrant issue more concretely. The latter justifies the introduction of migrant non-skilled workers, by citing the anticipated decrease in the number of labour power in the future because of a decrease in the nation's fertility rate (*Mainichi Shimbun* 2004, February 6). *Mainichi* is more specific in referring to poor coordination between ministries as a constraint in the FTA negotiations, citing the case of caregivers and masseurs as illustration. These pertinent ministries differ in their requirements and expectations, resulting in their lack of a unified policy on migrant workers. For instance, the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare demands that each migrant worker should reach the Japanese qualification standard (as well as knowing the

Japanese language) so as to prevent medical accidents, while the Ministry of Justice is concerned with peace and security, stressing that the relaxation of immigration laws for migrant workers is least likely to maintain peace and security. The Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry in turn insists that the other ministries should be more lax in their respective conditionalities for the ratification of FTA. *Mainichi Shimbun* adds that Japanese immigration policy does not include the caregiver and masseur categories, implying the need to change immigration regulations in order to accommodate these new developments (2004, February 6).

Basically, the main objective in pointing out these conflicting and tight immigration regulations is to criticize the country's perceived slow economic progress, together with presenting the eventuality of the Japanese economy lagging behind, if the FTA is poorly ratified by ASEAN. Though the government has sponsored ministerial-level conferences to break vertically structured administration for the promotion of FTA (*Sankei Shimbun* 2004, March 11), ministerial cooperation toward FTA ratification is still not well-coordinated. (This has been established by the author's personal communication to the Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry.) This lack of cooperation and coordination is partly due to the fact that specific issues - for instance in the case of caregivers - such as language problem, labour market competition between local and foreign caregivers, labour conditions, and welfare of care recipients have not been sufficiently discussed.

Such inattention by the ministries, in the case of migrant caregivers, is reflected in the small number of articles on the issue appearing in the three newspapers, despite their generally favorable view of the FTA. One of these few articles that appeared in *Yomiuri Shimbun* states simply that Japan needs to introduce migrant caregivers, because some areas in the country lack these workers (2004, March 12). Thus far, only one article cites the necessity for babysitters (*Yomiuri Shimbun* 2004, March 12) stressing that the availability of babysitters will rid mothers of many constraints against holding jobs outside the home.

Though *Mainichi* is relatively more detailed in its rationale for the introduction of nurses and caregivers into the country, it is silent about the perceived impact on homes for the aged and hospitals, where local caregivers, nurses, and care recipients will be most directly affected. The difference in newspaper coverage on the migrant worker issue is a matter of emphasis: the *Yomiuri Shimbun* and *Sankei Shimbun* both focus on the practical advantage of introducing non-skilled migrant workers as a means of ratifying the FTA, while the *Mainichi Shimbun* simply zeroes in on the country's existing need for migrant workers. The media coverage of the FTA vis-à-vis the migrant worker issue has arisen from the bigger framework of geo-politics but thus far, the media has not yet given specific analyses of the labour market for caregivers and nurses, or given space to specific voices of concerned people, such as the caregivers themselves, the care recipients in home-for-the-aged, and the nurses in ho spitals.

### 2. INCREASE IN THE NUMBER OF CRIMES

The increase of crimes committed by foreign residents, as gathered from the Metropolitan Police Department, is undoubtedly emphasized in the media. *Sankei Shimbun*, for example, reports that the number of arrested foreign nationals last year is the highest at 20 thousand, representing an increase of 3,800 persons from the previous year. This figure is broken down by nationality into: Chinese at 9,000 (45 per cent of the total arrests), Koreans (9 per cent) and Filipinos (7 per cent) (*Sankei* 2004, March 12). *Mainichi Shimbun* also reports that organized crimes like robbery and larceny among these foreign nationals are increasing (2004, March 11).

Interestingly, the media has criticized the police for the latter's manipulation of statistics and handling of crime reports. *Mainichi Shimbun* has published an interview with an exauthor of *White Paper on Crime*, a publication by the Metropolitan Police Department (2004 February 24). The interview reveals that statistics on crime is affected by police policy line. For example, the recent downward arrest ratio does not necessarily mean that Japan is now experiencing a decrease in the number of crimes committed, but that this is simply a result of a change in the policy line. The article states that the police used to arrest those who committed minor offenses, such as bicycle theft, in order to boost their arrest ratio. The interviewe frankly admits that statistics change according to the policy line, and also divulges the fact that juvenile crimes and crimes, committed by foreigners, have been used as scapegoats by the police in the past. The article thus declares that the increasing number of crimes is due to stricter immigration control, not to an actual increase in the number of crimes committed.

The above observation has been echoed by migrant-supporting organizations. According to the *Migrant Network News* of December 2003, issued by the Solidarity Network with Migrants in Japan, the increase in the number of crimes is partly due to the tight investigations, conducted in the Kanto Area by the Metropolitan Police Department in 2003, resulting in a greater number of immigration law violations, but not necessarily in the number of actual criminal offences. Moreover, this increase in the number of criminal offences is a result of the interrogation of arrested foreign thieves about the latter's knowledge of other thefts committed. The other factor, as mentioned, in the increase in the number of foreign persons who committed criminal offences is the tighter investigation on small crimes. For instance, more than half of the crimes listed are categorized under "others" such as riding a left bicycle.

KUMUSTAKA, a migrant supporting organization in Kyushu, which has contributed the aforementioned article to the *Migrant News Network*, further reveals the biased inclination against foreigners in the coverage of their crimes. A staff member of Amnesty International confirms that data on migrants are totally dependent on national statistics released from the Metropolitan Police Department or other pertinent government agencies. Though the Police White Paper has issued a special feature on 'the increasing crimes committed by foreign residents', migrant-supporting organizations say that this is misleading information, in that it actually magnifies just a small percentage (about six percent) of the total crimes committed in Japan. Media coverage largely

adheres to press releases from various government agencies, resulting in the emphases and sensationalization - even by the relatively "leftwing" *Asahi* newspaper - of the increasing crime rate of foreign residents. This sensationalized media coverage has been commented against by migrant supporting organizations.

The KUMUSTAKA study shows that the *media coverage ratio* of crimes committed by foreign residents has been rapidly increasing, which inevitably gives the impression that foreign nationals are committing more and more crimes in Japan.

The study cites specific figures, contrasting the total number of foreigners arrested for various criminal offences in the 1990s with that of today. The total arrests figure was 7,692 in 1990, with media coverage of merely 1.4 per cent; that is, only 1.4 per cent of total criminal offences committed by foreign residents was given attention by the media. In contrast, 10,963 foreign nationals were arrested in 2000, with media coverage of 12.8 per cent. This figure has further increased to 13,077 persons, with media coverage of 16.3 per cent, in 2002. *This signifies that the media coverage is not really proportionate to the increase in the number of arrests, only that the media is paying more attention to crimes done by foreign residents*. This is therefore clear evidence of the media's general adherence to the government's perceived bias in its undue emphasis on the increase of crimes offences by foreign residents. This sensationalized reporting of statistics has worked against the reputation of foreign nationals leading certain migrant supporting organizations to accuse the media of *"blind belief" in government pronouncements.* 

But the above does not necessarily mean that the media always follows the government's line every time as shown in the following illustration. The government has launched a campaign to decrease undocumented workers within five years by half (around 125,000 persons) in 2003, as well as proposed a revision of the Immigration Control Act in February 2004. On February 16, 2004, the Immigration Bureau posted an information reporting system on undocumented foreigners in its web site, encouraging citizens to contribute to the web page. The reporting system includes the following information about undocumented workers: residence and workplace, nationality, name, number of persons, reason for reporting these foreign nationals such as being a nuisance, or posing a threat to security.

*Mainichi Shimbun* looked into the issue five days after the web page was set up (2004, February 21). The resulting article commented on the possibility that the system encourages discrimination against both documented and undocumented foreign residents. The Immigration Bureau made a minor revision of the web page in March (*Mainichi Shimbun* 2004, April 1) after the publication of the article generated protests from migrant supporting organizations. In addition, *Mainichi Shimbun* has covered protests from the Hyogo Prefecture against this breach of human rights since the web page gives the impression that foreign residents are all potentially criminals (2004, April 14).

### **II. TV programs**

There is a seeming difference in the way the print media and the broadcast media treat the migrant issue. A typical example is that of the undocumented Burmese activist married to an undocumented Filipina, who were both about to be repatriated by the Immigration Bureau.

The Burmese man came to Japan in 1988 and became an expatriate activist, opposing the military government of Myanmar. Since 1992, he has been undocumented. His Filipina wife, Maria, entered Japan several times since 1986 with a fake passport to work in the entertainment industry. They got to know each other in 1991, and got married the next year. They have two daughters, who are both Philippine nationals because Myanmar does not acknowledge international marriages. The daughters only speak in Japanese since their parents only communicate in Japanese. The husband applied as a refugee in 1994, but was rejected by the Immigration Bureau in 1998. Therefore, his entire family was faced with the deportation process. He raised a formal objection, but the case initially turned out against his favour. His case was elevated to the high court, and the high court's final judgment, which affirmed the lower court's decision, was handed down toward the end of 2003. This turn of events left the family in a dilemma: if they repatriated, the husband had to go to back to Myanmar, while his wife and two daughters would return to the Philippines. Compounding matters is the high possibility that the husband will be arrested upon arrival in his country because of his being an expatriate activist while in Japan. Interestingly, despite objections of the Minister of Justice and the Prime Minister in issuing the family special residence permit, the family was still given special residence permit in March 2004.

The above case was aired by TV stations several times, especially by the Tokyo Broadcasting System (TBS). TBS has a nationwide network and is an affiliate of the *Mainichi Shimbun* newspaper. TBS aired the event when the husband was separated with his family having been detained by the Immigration officials in October, 2003. This created a sympathetic wave among viewers that led to a signature campaign (4,000 signatures were collected in 4 days) appealing for his release. TBS shot scenes of the signature campaign for his release, as well as for the granting of his family special permit residence permit in Japan. Moreover, TBS and other newspapers played up the difference in opinions between, on one side, the Minister of Health and the Minister of Labor and Welfare, who were both in favour of granting the family special permit in order to prevent the members from being separated, and on the other side, the Minister of Justice who was against granting of such permit.

Nevertheless, the core point of this problem was not covered by the media, which is the fact that the decreasing number of labour power, due to low fertility rate and the elimination of undocumented workers, are connected to the granting of a special residence permit. A director-general of the Tokyo Immigration Bureau replying to this author's question, commented that, although the Japanese government does not readily exercise amnesty in similar cases, the government will continue considering to grant special residential permits to undocumented residents who have lived in the society for years as good citizens.

He has also added that the successful elimination of undocumented residents is not necessarily achieved through deportation alone, but instead in combination with the granting of special residence permits. According to his handout in one conference in Osaka, this same official has taken the view that if Japan wants to keep the same GDP in the future, it has no choice but to import foreign labour, due to the anticipated decrease in the number of children in the near future. This future scenario can be connected with special residence permits, since the grant of such a permit can be a means of maintaining both future population and labour power. This viewpoint has also been expressed in an *Asahi Shimbun* editorial (2003, November 9). It is however, still worth noting that very few articles have related the Burmese case recounted earlier in this paper to Japan's demographic and economic problems.

## **Results of the Media Questionnaire Survey**

1. Organization	KBS	Ryukyu Shimpo	Mainichi Shimbun
2. Position	reporter	Proofreader	Reporter
3. Type of Med	TV	Newspaper	Newspaper
4. Ownership	Private	Private	Private
5. Reach	Local	Local	National
6.Audience Share	Influential in the region	About 200,000	About 4 million

### 1. Profile of media organisations/individuals interviewed

*Ryukyu Shimpo* has an English edition at 2/3 of one page once a week. This report refers to the English edition.

## 2. From and editorial point of view, how important is the coverage of transnational migration issues for your organization?

KBS	Not so important. Editor doesn't think transnational migration is
	significant.
	Significant, especially articles relating to US military bases, base personnel,
Ryukyu Shimpo	and AmerAsians. Because we are an English page, I think we sometimes
	choose topics that are relevant to foreigners in or related to Okinawa,
	especially on any problems relating to US bases and base personnel.
Mainichi	Our country regards transnational migrants, especially those from Asia and
	Latin America not as human beings but as labourers. Taking up the issue of
	migrants reflecting social contradictions would be the first step to the

realization of better society and it would improve their living conditions.
Transnational migration issues also let us know that we cannot survive
without co-existing with them.

## **3.** How often does your organization cover issues of transnational migration/ foreign immigrants?

MBC	Not so often. When events are released from related organization or police agency.
Ryukyu Shimpo	Not on a regular basis because news does not come packaged on a predictable and timetabled basis, but whenever topics relating to <i>Uchinanchu</i> returnees (overseas Okinawans who returned from outside Japan) and their achievements or difficulties, we seem to give them prominence. The Uchinanchu taikai (festival for Okinawan descendants) always get maximum covering, World Uchinanchu Business Association also gets coverage.
Mainichi	Depends. Recent coverage is the labour accident compensation issue of transnational migrants; exchange program between ethnic Koreans and Japanese; reconciliation between ethnic Koreans from North Korea and the Democratic People's Republic of Korea.

## 4. What is the nature of the reports on transnational migration written and broadcast by your organization.

r	
	a) political: sensitive issue is not profoundly covered.
	b) socio-economic:
	c) crime: recent increasing crimes
KBS	d) terrorism/national security: not an issue
	e) human interest:
	f) light humour: cultural events are often covered if information is released beforehand
Ryukyu	a) political: as mentioned above
Shimpo	<ul> <li>b) socio-economic: Okinawans need to feel that the islands are recognized in an international context. One example would be Daigakuin Daigaku, an international graduate school to be founded, which is supposed to be a hyper-international development. Academics coming for conference and research projects often get covered. Amerasian children and intermarriage was a big story in the context of the special school founded for them. International Centre gets relatively quite a lot of coverage and interaction with the local community is also mentioned, such as home-stays.</li> <li>c) crime: Emphasis on the least infraction of law or occurrence of accident in which US military personnel are involved. I tend to feel that there is a rush to mention the names of US (and any foreigner involved in problems) whereas local people's names are omitted until arrest or being charged.</li> </ul>

	d) terrorism/national security: Senkaku Island (Daiaoyu Island) issues always make an appearance. North Korean ships was perhaps a story in the last two years. Fear of terrorism in Okinawa, because of the presence of US bases here, have been mentioned, but it is not a story in itself.
	e) human interest: profile stories about what individual foreigners are doing here sometimes crop up as 'Briefs'.
	<ul> <li>f) light humour: we are not strong on light humour. There is much on Okinawan drummers, dancers, musicians, painters going abroad or living abroad.</li> </ul>
Mainichi	a) political:
	b) socio-economic: readers want to know what the reason of their coming to Japan is. So we need to provide related coverage.
	c) crime: it is true that media covers crime issue again and again but readers want to know the cause of it.
	d) terrorism/national security:
	e) human interest: exchange programs
	f) light humour: exchange programs

## 5. What kind of reporters are assigned to cover issues of transnational migration/immigrants?

KBS	Junior
Ryukyu Shimpo	Junior
Mainichi	Junior

## 6. What resources does your organization allocate for the coverage of issues of transnational migration/immigrant?

KBS	Release, reporters/correspondents, personal connections
Ryukyu Simpo	Reportage

Mainichi	Through communication with them. But we have to be careful not to cause mutual misunderstanding.
----------	--

## 7. What kind of background knowledge do the journalists in your organization have in transnational migration issues?

KBS	On the job training.
Ryukyu Shimpo	On the job training
Mainichi	Average knowledge on international and immigration law, human rights, and international relations. A little knowledge on social work.

## 8 Does your organization hire foreign immigrants for editorial/reportial work?

KBS	none
Ryukyu Shimpo	Yes
Mainichi	Yes, Korea

## **9.** Does your organization have specific editorial policies and ethical guidelines for covering foreign migrants/immigrant?

KBS	Nothing special.		
Ryukyu Shimpo	Yes. As mentioned above		
Mainichi	Yes		

## 10. What obstacles, if any, does your organization face in the coverage of transnational migration issue?

	a) public apathy: not a problem
	b) financial constraints: yes, but never a major problem
	c) state censorship/pressure: free
	d) editorial biases: yes
	e) racist/nationalist attitudes: big obstacle. For example, though ethnic
	Korean and ethnic Chinese issue is locally and nationally very
KBS	important, they are seldom covered. This organization is indifferent
	of the topic and reports that need long research are not welcomed.
	Therefore, when a reporter picks up related topics with short research
	periods, without constructing rapport with informants, the program
	may end up with irresponsible broadcast. The atmosphere of the
	company is not heading toward to construction of multinational
	society. We deal with transnational migrants not as a neighbour but

,	
	<ul> <li>as a temporary guest (though it is not necessarily the case).</li> <li>f) ignorance of journalists: very much. One of the difficulties in reporting issues on transnational migration are due to ignorance of journalists, and partly due to lack of staff. Our sources of information are highly dependent on press releases from related organization or police agencies. Therefore, cultural events or criminal affairs where there is no need of in-advance research, and where there is no need of constructing mutual relationship with informants, are inclined to be topics to be aired. Lately, the number of crimes by foreigners are rapidly increasing. <i>There is an instruction from editors that crimes by foreigners released from police are to be covered. The problems here are that analysis on causes of crimes are not conducted in research but broadcasted, which may end up with implanting the idea to viewers that transnational migrants simply commit crimes.</i></li> <li>g) poor standards of reporting: big problem. See above.</li> <li>h) Others</li> </ul>
	a) public apathy: there are a number of genuinely generous people who devote their free time to helping foreigners in this place.
	b) financial constraints: no
	c) state censorship/pressure: free
Ryukyu Shimpo	d) editorial biases: as mentioned above, emphasis on coverage of the least infraction of law or occurrence of accidents by US military personnel are involved. Similar accidents involving the local population often would not get coverage. That is unfair – except that I would point out that if the US forces were not here, such accidents would never have occurred.
	e) racist/nationalist attitudes: no
	f) ignorance of journalists: no
	g) poor standards of reporting: no
	h) others: no
Mainichi	a) public apathy: not particularly
	b) financial constraints: very big.
	c) state censorship/pressure: not particularly.
	d) editorial biases: not particularly.
	e) racist/nationalist attitudes: not particularly
	f) ignorance of journalists: not particularly.
	g) poor standards of reporting: not particularly.

h) others: the existence of media organization that set up biases against
transnational migrants. To improve coverage on transnational migration,
hiring policy, training education would play an important role.

## Conclusion

As illustrated in the analysis done in this short paper, there is a difference in the way the media, specifically the print and broadcast media, cover the issues on transnational migration. Three nationwide newspapers, representing the print media, have been considered in this study. Of the three, *Sankei*, one of the four major newspapers in Japan, has the least number of published articles on the migrant worker issue. Despite this fact, *Sankei* has taken the same stance as the other two newspapers in its support of the FTA negotiations, as well as in its tendency to sensationalize the increasing number of crimes committed by foreign residents. These newspapers' perspective on FTA is a bit subdued by the anti-globalization movement, but it still asserts the leading role that Japan should be playing in Asia through the FTA.

Another convergence among the three newspapers is their stress – verging, at times, on sensationalism – on the increase in the number of crimes committed by foreign nationals, despite protests from migrant supporting organizations. The stalemate has led some migrant support organizations to criticize media coverage on this particular topic in their own newsletters, accusing the media of spreading misleading information by freely utilizing statistics from the Metropolitan Police Department, without pausing to consider how the statistics have been constructed.

On another front, broadcast media, represented by TV in this study, has done a different take on the migrant worker issue. By looking closely into the lives of selected migrant workers, it has been able to arouse citizens' awareness of and concern for the plight of migrant workers in their society. For instance, it was ironically through the unrelenting intrusion of TV cameras that an undocumented migrant worker-couple gained sympathy from viewers, enabling them and their children to get a special resident permit despite the courts denying them their earlier application, as well as the initial objections of both the Prime Minister and the Minister of Justice for such a permit. TV coverage of their situation generated strong public opinion, so much so that the government was forced to bend its Immigration policy a little to stem public protests.

Another type of broadcast media that plays an important role in foreign residents' lives is Community FM radio (although this type has not been mentioned previously in this study). Some community FM have genuine relevance to foreign residents in as much as some programs are presented in the migrant workers' native tongue, while others deal with counselling, legal assistance and other matters, truly vital to their survival in a foreign land.

Staff writers' opinions zoom in on problems of coverage on transnational migration. One staff writer mentioned that, athough recent coverage on crimes may be misleading, it is a demand from readers to provide information on the issue. This implies a dilemma for a reporter.

The responsibility of writers is significant. Though bias may be related to editing policy, indifference of staff writers is also a constraint to better quality of the coverage. One reporter says, reporters need to face the reality so that they can understand the structure of transnational migration issues. Another says, training and education must come to top priority in understanding the issue. Since it seems that on-the-job training is more common in Japan, training and education may well affect perceptions on transmigration issue. The transnational migration issue will continue to be more significant in Japan, taking into consideration the more influx of migrants, due to more demands for foreigners and due to the changing policy of Japanese government. The role of the media, in reporting from different angles, will give readers/viewers choices of opinion formation.

## **MEDIA SUMMARY – KOREA**

## By Dr Ryu Jeong Soon

## I. Preface

The migrant worker issue is no longer foreign to the Korean media. For some time, there has been significant proliferation on the discussion of migrant workers (often dubbed as 'illegal foreign workers') on the pages of the Korean news media. Over the last several months, during which intense labour union strikes and foreign worker legislation took place, the migrant worker issue has enjoyed frequent coverage on the newspapers in both positive and negative ways. In particular, the recent controversy over the legislation replacing the Industrial Trainee system with the Work Permit system drew out a significant number of responses from the news media. This shift was seen as a significantly contentious topic, due to the immediate impact it would make not only on workplaces but on the domestic workforce as a whole.

At the time of the presidential election campaign in 2002, NGOs tried very hard to draw out a public pledge of legislation for a Work Permit System and abolish the Trainee System. Both candidates from the Grand National Party and the Democratic Party promised to legislate the Work Permit Act. However, the conservative Grand National Party made a change of stance after the defeat. This was a consequence of mounting pressure from industry, fearing that the Work Permit would result in soaring wages as well as xenophobia directed to migrant workers. In the month of May 2003, the longawaited Work Permit system, which is to replace the Industrial Trainee system, was finally put into legislation on the basis of human rights protection, a presidential promise, stabilizing workforce supply and the good of the domestic market.

The objective of this study is to analyze the ways in which media covered this contentious issue. 3 major categories of the analysis are newspaper, TV and radio.

## II. Newspaper

For the purpose of newspaper comparison, the four most influential newspapers were chosen and analyzed.

The study focuses on the frequency, the perspective and the ways in which the articles are tied to other issues on the *Chosun*, the *Hankyorae*, the *Joongang* and the *Maekyong Daily News*, published between January and August of 2003. In Korea, these 3 major newspapers have more than 2/3rds of total subscription. They are very powerful and also very conservative. The *Chosun Ilbo* is the most influential and the most conservative. However, *Hangyerae Shinmoon*, which is very progressive, has a considerable amount of subscription. Although by no means do they represent the entire news media, the selection is sufficient to serve as the barometer of the media climate and serve as useful media spectrum.

## 1) Newspaper Article Reviews

4 newspapers were surveyed between the April and the August of 2003. Numbers of articles were as follows:

Name	Chosun	Joongang	Hankyurae	Maekyung
Nos. of article	54	66	62	33
Column	1	7	8	5
Editorial	2	5	6	5
Total	57	78	76	53

In *Chosun Ilbo* there were total of 60 articles on the subject of the migrant workers issue. Of the 54 articles, 15 of them took negative stance, 22 neutral, and 17 favourable ones. The portion of negative articles far outnumbers that of other papers. Significantly, the two editorials and one column specifically dealt with the issue of migrant workers. The editorials and column were generally negative towards the Work Permit System.

*Hankyurae Shinmun* is situated at the other end of the spectrum from the *Chosun Ilbo*, and has published 62 articles in total, 12 of which were neutral articles, 3 negative and 63 positive ones. The majority of them addressed the current structural discrimination and inequality faced by migrant workers and maintained a positive tone towards the issue. That is, the eight columns and six editorials urged the government and opposition to go through with the Work Permit law as originally promised.

*Joongang Ilbo*, which is owned by Samsung Group, which occupies the middle of the ideological spectrum amongst the newspapers, published 77 articles on the issue: 38 positive reporting, 13 negative reporting and 26 neutral ones. The paper also ran a special forum dedicated to the topic of migrant workers in June. In the forum, speakers were invited from both sides.

*Maeil Kyungjae* (Everyday Economic News) ran a total of 33 articles - 11 positive articles, 10 negative, and 22 neutral articles. The paper devoted less pages, compared to other major newspapers, and the featured articles were often straight headline news pieces. The coverage was somewhat sporadic and irregular but the paper made a very strong effort to put points across that represented the interest of the business owners. The newspaper dedicated one special feature forum in which the issue was discussed, though it was rather hostile in bias against migrant workers' human rights.

## 2. Perspective

## 2.1 Chosun Ilbo

*Chosun Ilbo* is known for its rightwing viewpoint and tough stance on migrant workers. Characterizing the migrant worker as a source of draining of the national wealth and threatening the economy by taking away jobs of the domestic workers, *Chosun Ilbo* often painted negative pictures of the migrant worker issue. However, statistics show that *Chosun Ilbo* has considerably warmed up on the migrant worker issue of late. There are two explanations for this recent turn: firstly, this could be a strategic move. The newspaper may be siding with migrant worker as a means of criticizing the domestic labour union and to undermine the public support for them. Secondly, the ambivalence towards the migrant worker issue could be indicative of the nervousness associated with

the economic instability of current time. The constant fluctuation of the market characterizes the globalized economy, wherein instability is the norm rather than exception. As a way of countering this instability, the influx of relatively low wage migrant worker is now suggested. Here lies the heart of the most troubling aspect of the *Chosun's* coverage: *Chosun* is framing the issue to reduce the issue as simply an economic one. The bigger picture of social justice and human rights is left out of the picture. As such, Chosun Ilbo has been, out of necessity, often inconsistent in their reporting and has showed a serious lack of sensitivity. The newspaper published very prejudiced and questionable articles on migrant workers' alleged criminal behavior side by side an article exposing abusive labour practices done by Korean employers. Simply put, the paper was running along the line that served their interest, depending on the situation. A recent editorial urging the government to place mandatory disease checkups on every migrant worker was one of many articles indicative of the ways in which *Chosun* has reinforced their biases. The virtual absence of any discussion of human rights pertaining to the migrant worker issue was another indication of their biased reporting practice.

## 2.2 Hankyurae Shinmun (Hankyurae)

*Hankyurae Shinmun* is Korea's leading representative of progressive politics and of social justice. Accordingly, the migrant worker issue has enjoyed very positive reporting, uncovering not only the loopholes and faults of the current system from which many migrant workers suffer, but also frequently addressing the topic in terms of human rights issue, side by side the brutal work environment under which the workers work. Unlike the other mainstream media, which focus on individual cases, the *Hankyurae* made great efforts to point out structural problems and convey the greater social picture. Several editorials and columns served as conduits through which to voice current concerns, as well as awareness of the harsh living and working conditions that migrant workers have to face.

### 2.3 Joongang Ilbo

*Joongang Ilbo* has shown consistency in ambivalence towards the issue, though officially, the paper has maintained a positive tone in their editorials. Insofar as political standing is concerned, *Joongang Ilbo* is moderate conservative. Another significant fact in understanding this paper is that it is owned and run by the SamSung Corporation, and has often leaned towards the corporate, when corporate interest - directly or indirectly - is concerned. There appear some efforts to provide balanced coverage on the topic, but the paper seems to fall short on its effort as it has provides disproportionate reporting on criminal cases and often conflates the connection between the migrant worker and the crimes. Where corporate interest is involved, the *Joongang* has not shown impartial reporting. The absence of any human rights discussion in the coverage may be understood in light of this circumstance.

### 2.4 Maeil Kyungjae Shinmun

*Maeil Kyungjae* is the influential industry-leading newspaper, specializing in economics and business. By its very nature, this paper has been the staunchest defender of corporate and business interests, oftentimes showing blatant hostility towards the migrant worker

issue to the extent that at one point their editorial piece suggested the Work Permit system be scrapped altogether, due to its economic impracticality. Its claim of economic viability notwithstanding, throughout the publication, there is no evidence concerning the basic human rights issues of the migrant worker. *Maeil Kyungjae* has expressed consistent and thorough objections to the idea of applying and expanding the principle of social equality and justice to those who chose to come to work in Korea. This is on account of protecting domestic economics and maintaining low wages, but conveniently overlooks the contributions that migrant workers have made. Fitting nicely with this inclination is the polemics employed to argue not only self-serving political agenda of the particular class (i.e., business owners) but forming unnecessary prejudiced ideas that would undoubtedly contribute to further public biases and hostility towards migrant workers.

### **3. Summary of Newspaper Review**

In this short survey, the four mainstream papers were examined in their manner of coverage of migrant worker issues between the January and August of 2003. The nature of editorials and the frequency of reporting of the four newspapers, ranging from conservative to progressive political continuum, were studied in order to understand each paper's manners. Specifically, the study included how they might attempt to shape public discourse regarding the issue of migrant workers, which was intensely scrutinized before and after the legislation of the Work Permit system. More so than anything, out of these public debates in the newspapers emerged the particular public discourse around migrant workers.

It is not uncommon for the media to represent a particular political view. However, what is perhaps uncommon is the fact that the newspaper themselves swayed back and forth with respect to political and economical climates of the day. Since the national economy and political economy are intimately connected to national economic growth (of which there has been serious growing concern), there is a tendency to frame the issue of migrant workers exclusively in terms of an economic framework, and attempt to reduce the whole problem in economical terms.

For instance, coverage of the issue experienced a sudden change of tone, as influenced by a series of labour union strikes. A stringent backlash against the series of militant labour union strikes that took place around at the same time, resulted in migrant worker coverage suddenly turning positive in tone, with praises for their work ethic and willingness to work for less than the average domestic workers. With primarily negative reporting on the fierce domestic union strikes, the news media have looked rather positively upon the alternative source of labour.

The sudden surge of coverage could be attributed to the legislation of new sets of laws on migrant workers, in addition to the backlash against the union strikes. Sadly, this kind of opportunistic attitude characterizes the typical mainstream media's response to social events. Rather than having a coherent and consistent editorial guideline based on foundational belief - whether critical or favourable - newspapers like the *Chosun* and the *Joongang* made very subjective reports of the issue as they saw fit for the occasion,

exploiting it for their political agenda. By evacuating the significant dimensions of basic human rights and social equality and justice, readers are left with a very distorted and narrow comprehension of the issue, which can be further exploited to reinforce the preconception.

The only exception to this was the *Hankyurae Shinmun*, which made considerable efforts to deliver the issue in terms of human rights issues and attempted to move away from simple economic reductionism.

In sum, conservative newspapers such as the *Chosun*, the *Joongang* and the *Maeil* dealt with the issue by selective and inconsistent coverage as well as running biased articles to undermine the proposed legislation and its public support. Countering this was the *Hankyurae*, which attempted to balance the debate by bringing in social equality and human rights into the picture. Instead of manipulating the coverage to push their political agenda, a fair reporting practice is very much urged from the conservative media.

## **III.** Television

TV is quite different from Newspapers. There are 3 major channels i.e. KBS, MBC & SBS covering the whole nation. The government designates the president of 2 major TVs (KBS & MBC), which are rather progressive (since President Roh is progressive). These 2 TVs are sympathetic to migrant workers and tried to persuade the audience to abolish the Industrial Trainee System and legislate the Work Permit System.

MBC even broadcasted a program title called "!" with subtitle of "Asia!, Asia!" on the prime time on Saturday. This program is about an undocumented foreign migrant worker from another part of Asia who cannot go back to his country, and misses his family. Every week MBC selects one migrant worker and invites a family member from his country and makes a family reunion possible in the studio. MBC does all the procedures to get visa, air ticket and provide all the expenses while staying in Korea. 17 foreign migrant workers met their family through this program in 2003. The audience shared the feeling of family reunion and cried while watching. 30~38% of the whole TV audience watched this program, which was awarded quite a few prizes including *The Best Prize Chosen by the Audience* because this program contributed a lot to change Korean peoples' prejudice against foreign migrant workers. One day just before the Work Permit Act was to be tabled in the Diet (Parliament), this program was broadcast in the Blue House (President Roh's residence) and President Roh commented that these migrant workers contribute a lot to the Korean economy, and living together with them as friendly neighbours is a way of truly becoming global village citizens. His persuasion played a big role in the Work Permit Act being passed.

## IV. Radio

Most radio broadcasting services deal with migrant worker issues as part of news or news commentary. However, there is a progressive radio station named "Radio 21". Every Sunday from 4:00 ~5:00 PM, a talk show "Your Korea" used to be run by a foreign migrant. MC of the program and guests were all migrant workers (most of them were so-called illegal aliens). In the program, foreign migrant workers' voices used to be directly

heard and they appealed to audiences how they had been treated. Human rights and labour rights violation cases were mainly reported. Now this program has stopped, because a new law will be implemented and the moratorium period for them to go back to their country has expired. The government has started to chase so-called illegal aliens back, and repatriate them.

## V. Result of the Media Survey

Korea is a nation state of a largely single homogeneous ethnic group. Before, people didn't have the experience of living together with foreigners. So the whole country is very anti-alien and people are very much prejudiced against foreign migrant workers. They want to use cheap foreign migrant workers' labour. However, they don't seem to know that labour means human beings coming together.

Peoples' prejudice is reflected in newspapers, TV and radio. As stated above, most of the major newspapers including the major 3 big newspapers are not advocating migrant workers. I tried to contact executive level journalists from these organizations. Most of them refused to be interviewed, saying it is their organization's policy not to be interviewed on this vulnerable subject. I managed to intervie w 3 directors of media that are favorable to migrant workers. One is MBC TV and the other 2 are *Hangyore* Daily Newspaper and *Daehan* Daily Newspaper. Summary of the survey results are as follows:

1. Organization	MBC (one of the big 3 TV)	Hankyurae Newspaper	Daehan Daily Newspaper
2. Position	Managing Director	Director, General	Director, General
3. Type of Media	TV	Newspaper	Newspaper
4. Ownership	Private*	Private	Private
5. Reach	National	National	National
6. Audience Share	One of the most influential	Circulation: 50million-999,999	Circulation: 50million-999,999

## 1. Summary of replying Survey/ Questionnaire for Media Professionals

\* However, as the president is appointed by the government, it is not free from government supervision

## 2. From an editorial point of view, how important is the coverage of transborder migration issues for your organization?

MBC	Not important at all

Hankyurae Newspaper	Very Important
Daehan Daily Newspaper	Very Important

## **3.** How often does your organization cover issues of transborder migration/ foreign immigrants?

MBC	When there is news or issues coming out. Not often.
Hankyurae Newspaper	It depends. However, when the issue comes up, we deal with this issue seriously. As Hankyurae Newspaper counts human rights and protection of labour rights very important
Daehan Daily Newspaper	As we think human rights of foreign migrant workers are not protected properly, we continuously try to change the prejudice against them, sometimes in the news, sometimes in the opinion column, sometimes in the editorial

## **1.** What is the nature of the reports on transborder migration written and broadcast by your organization?

MBC	a) political: pro protection of Korean labourers' jobs		
	b) socio-economic: pro Korean economy		
	c) crime: neutral		
MBC	d) terrorism/national security: not an issue in Korea		
	e) human interest: Very good program: Asia! Asia!		
	f) light humour Very good program: Asia! Asia!		
Hankyurae Newspaper	a) political: protection of human rights. especially labour rights		
	b) socio-economic: living together with foreign workers peacefully, legalize their status		
	c) crime: not an issue in Korea		
	d) terrorism/national security: not an issue in Korea		
	e) human interest: Try hard to persuade audience not to have prejudiced		
	f) light humour: no		

	a) political: Protection of human rights by advocating to change the law	
	b) socio-economic: Since they contribute a lot to Korean economy by providing cheap labour, Korea should protect their labour rights.	
Dashan Daily	c) crime: not an issue in Korea	
Daehan Daily Newspaper	d) terrorism/national security: not an issue in Korea	
	e) human interest: interested in improving welfare i.e. education of migrant workers' children & coverage of medical care insurance	
	f) light humour: Doesn't cover at all.	

## 5. What kind of reporters are assigned to cover issues of transborder migration/immigrant?

MBC	News young junior reporter, Labour Policy - senior
Hankyurae Newspaper	Junior
Daehan Daily Newspaper	Junior

## 6. What resources does your organization allocate for the coverage of issues of transborder migration/immigrant?

MBC	reporters/correspondents(almost all), subject matter specialists( occasionally)
Hankyurae Newspaper	reporters/correspondents(70%), subject matter specialists(25%) specialized research materials/ library/database(5%)
Daehan Daily Newspaper	reporters/correspondents(40%), subject matter specialists(20%), specialized training(20%), specialized research materials/ library/database(20%)

## 7. What kind of background knowledge do the journalists in your organization have in transborder migration issue?

MBC	human rights, others(Economy, labour)
Hankyurae Newspaper	human rights, social work
Daehan Daily Newspaper	human rights, social work

## 8 Does your organization hire foreign immigrants for editorial/reportial work?

MBC	none
Hankyurae Newspaper	none
Daehan Daily Newspaper	none

## 9. Does your organization have specific editorial policies and ethical guidelines for covering foreign migrants/immigrant?

MBC	Nothing special
Hankyurae Newspaper	Nothing special
Daehan Daily Newspaper	Nothing special

## 10. What obstacles, if any, does your organization face in the coverage of transborder migration issue?

MBC	No special obstacle
	a) public apathy: very big obstacle
	b) financial constraints: a little bit
	c) state censorship/pressure: free
www.	d) editorial biases: free
yurae Newspaper	e) racist/nationalist attitudes: big obstacle
	f) ignorance of journalists: a little bit
	g) poor standards of reporting
	h) others
Daehan Daily Newspaper	a) public apathy: very big obstacle
	b) financial constraints: some
	c) state censorship/pressure: free
	d) editorial biases: free
	e) racist/nationalist attitudes: big obstacle
	f) ignorance of journalists: to some extent, yes
	g) poor standards of reporting: a little bit

	h) others
--	-----------

### **11.** How can your organization improve coverage of transborder migration issue?

MBC	hiring policies (1st), editorial policies(2nd), training and education(3rd)
Hankyurae	training and education (1st), re-allocation of resources(2nd), hiring
Newspaper	policies(3rd)
Daehan Daily	training and education (1st), re-allocation of resources(2nd)
Newspaper	others(3rd)

## V. Conclusion

Recently there has been improvement to some extent. The Work Permit System has been legalized. However, the Industrial Trainee System is not abolished. Although President Roh had the will to do so, both systems were implemented because it was difficult to persuade the conservative opposition party who has majority vote in the parliament. Since the new system is a result of the political compromise, there is some 'poison pill' added in the new lawThe biggest poison pill in the new law is deportation. According to the new law, a migrant worker who stays more than 4 years should go back to his country. The government gave migrant workers a moratorium period, which expired in Febrary 2003.100,000 migrant workers should have gone back to their country, however, only 20,000 migrant workers voluntarily went back during the moratorium period. The rest of them are still staying and joined demonstrations in protest. The government arrested demonstration leaders and extended the moratorium period until March.

In Korea, the 3 big conservative newspapers (*Chosun, Joongang & Donga*) have a very big influence on public opinion. These newspapers don't like President Roh's rather generous policy and urges the government to deport them. The extreme right wing newspaper *Chosun* that has the largest subscription, commented in aneditorial "Where else, on the earth, are illegal foreign migrant workers demonstrating? Arrest all of them and deport them."

The most prominent demonstration leader, a so-called "illegal alien" was arrested at the demonstration site. After this incident happened, *Hankyurae* Daily Newspaper columnist, Professor Cho accused the government and urged it to release the leader and let him run for a national assembly representative position. This column clearly shows *Hankyrae's* perspective on dealing with migrant worker issues.

In Korea, of the 3 major national TV channels, all are rather pro- government. These days in the news, or any news analysis programmes, migrant worker issues are rarely seen although migrant workers have been demonstrating for more than 100 days and several leaders were arrested. The long-run MBC TV programme "!" - Asia, Asia" is still broadcasting. However, it now concentrates on Korean migrant workers working in other countries i.e. Japan, America, EU, and not migrant workers in Korea. This means that MBC doesn't want to be involved with this issue. The radio 21 talk show programme "*Your Korea*" which used to be broadcast every Sunday from 4:00 ~5:00 PM run by migrant workers stopped as the legal environment changed.

Migrant workers are still coming in because Korean industry needs cheap labour. However, basically, it can be said that the Korean people don't want to realize the important fact that labour and human beings are inseparable, that it is impossible to accept only labour and desert human beings. Some progressive media like *Hankyurae* are trying very hard to change prejudice of the people. However, most of other media are passive, and extreme right- wing newspapers, who are dominant in the formation of public opinion, tend to stick to prejudiced discrimination.

## MEDIA SUMMARY – MALAYSIA By Ann Lee

## Criteria

Media Guidelines for the survey research were revised in Phase II in the name of consistency, so that each researcher should largely focus on the following main media in their respective countries, and obtain interviews or answers to the questionnaire.

- 1) The most popular newspaper
- 2) The most popular TV News Bulletin
- 3) Any other that the researcher found worth highlighting

The main period of media survey was four months from August to November, 2002, (with an additional three months from September to November, 2003).

## Overview

During the main period of review, stories on migration issues were dominated by a particular repatriation exercise of both Indonesian and Filipino illegal migrants. While the Indonesian repatriation exercise from Peninsular Malaysia went on without apparent incident, largely as a result of the strong government-to-government ties and the long-standing relationship between Indonesia and Malaysia (which includes advanced notice and systems of assistance such as transport), the repatriation exercise for Filipino migrants from Sabah, was dominated by an event that led to a diplomatic 'showdown' between the Philippines and Malaysia.

What dominated media attention during this period was 'the story of Angelica', a 13 year old girl who was allegedly raped by Malaysian police officers during the repatriation of Filipino legal and illegal migrants from Sabah. Almost daily reports appeared on the issue, mainly front page or prominent inner pages, of comments by government officials, denials by the police, remarks by other parties involved in the allegation, and concern about the girl's nationality. Focus on the issue also appeared in Letters pages, editorials and opinion pieces. The Minister of Foreign Affairs first brought up the matter of nationality of the girl, which received front page coverage. The Prime Minister's comments also received dominant coverage, and appeared to downplay the incident as a whole. Womens groups complained about the bias of government officials' remarks, highlighting that the alleged rape of the girl was surely of more consequence than her nationality. These comments were reported, though not with the same prominent coverage.

No analyses citing reasons for repatriation, contribution of migrants, histories of migrant entries, or opinions of migrant workers were provided before, during or immediately after the issue 'blew over'.

As for other migrant worker issues, media coverage included crimes committed by foreign migrants, and also statistical reports of the number of documented foreign

workers in the country, announcements by the government, via various Ministries, regarding migration policies and laws. Perspectives largely followed government viewpoints, with the only other viewpoints gained from foreign embassies.

## Most Popular Newspaper – Berita Harian

According to AC Nielsen Malaysia, *Berita Harian* is the most widely read newspaper in the country. A broadsheet, owned by a company with strong ties to the dominant Malay ruling party, it is pro-government in opinion. Occasional opinion pieces do take a critical tone, though usually mild. Written in the national language (Bahasa Melayu/Malaysia), its only other competitor as a national daily is *Utusan Malaysia*.

## Note on other newspapers

Diversity of languages is protected by the national constitution, and newspapers of other languages are also available, largely as per ethnic community. Broadly speaking, there are also English language newspapers for the largely urban and market –centre readers, namely *the Star* and the *New Straits Times*; Chinese language newspapers for Chinese readers (urban but also rural) - *Sin Chew Jit Poh* and *Nanyang Siang Pau*, Tamil newspapers for Tamil speakers (urban/rural), *Tamil Nesan*. Other indigenous language papers, such as in Kadazan, are mainly state or community-specific, and not national.

## Most Popular TV News Bulletin – TV3 Bulletin Utama

Owned by a company with strong ties to the dominant Malay ruling party, this is the most popular news broadcast report, as per AC Nielsen figures. It is pro-government, like other stations with direct and indirect links to the dominant Malay party (the national network Radio Televisyen Malaysia is government-owned).

### Note on other tv stations

The number of other tv stations has increased in the last decade, including satellite channels, and also private-owned channels for mainly Peninsular Malaysia (excluding Sabah and Sarawak) audiences.

## Media Survey Questionnaire

Sourcing journalists and senior editors, from the identified main media, to complete the questionnaire was difficult. In one case, the senior representative of a media organization delegated it to another who delegated it to another, and by the time it was passed down, the junior journalist refused to take on the responsibility of providing comments, even 'off the record'. Three email requests to another organization during initial research were not answered, and a telephone call to the secretary of the media representative resulted in a request for a formal letter to be re-sent, but no official answer was received upon follow-up.

Furthermore, the author's efforts to view footage of country's most popular news bulletins, during the period under survey, were unsuccessful, despite repeated enquiries in writing, and follow up by phone. The author was told that the person responsible for authorising permission to view archives was unavailable, and/or "in a meeting".

This difficulty of access was surprising, and perhaps serves to underline a specific concern about the oft-termed 'power of the media'; its notions of professionalism. Discussion related to media practice does occur in the country, usually in the context of a government official, or editor of a directly government-linked paper, describing what the role of media should be ('constructive', 'supporting the needs of a developing country') There is also some debate in the context of media independence as an issue of freedom of speech (and this is largely due to the efforts of the small union of journalists, and NGO advocates of the freedom of speech and other human rights). These matters are reported – including for example, requests by journalists for the government to repeal the prohibitive Printing and Publications Act - albeit in smaller column space. It is perhaps too much to ask that the transparency and accountability of media organizations, and media journalists themselves, should come under much media scrutiny. At any rate, it is noteworthy that media organisations in Malaysia work under censorship constraints to the extent, for example, that their licenses to operate must be renewed annually by the government. This generally requires a strategy of careful avoidance of, or positioning in relation to, any potentially 'sensitive' issue (such as migration, which obviously involves government-to-government relationships). Internet media organisations are less concerned about this, although they too can be subject to harassment and challenge by government authorities.

Ultimately, the interviews included here were obtained through personal contacts, but the answers were given on the understanding that there would be no identification of the organization or representative involved.

### **INTERVIEW ONE**

Name: (Withheld) Designation: Assignment Editor Type of Media: TV Network Ownership: Private Reach: National and Regional Audience share/circulation: 1.5 - 2 million viewers

# 1) From an editorial point of view, how important is the coverage of transborder migration/migrant workers (whether documented or undocumented/legal or illegal) for your organisation?

If it involves legal workers, we broadcast issues like the Malaysian procedures on how to get permits to work here, more to educate the public and local companies wanting to hire foreign workers. The media is a medium to create awareness for migrants / public. We do cover issues which involve illegal workers, e-g crimes / increase of crime rates by illegal workers. This is to ensure that all workers in Malaysia enter the country legally.

### 2) How often does your organisation cover issues of transborder migration?

It depends. We cover issues that have news value, or are newsworthy. We do not have a specific number of times, which the transborder migration issues are covered on tv.

3) What is the nature of the reports on transborder migration written and broadcast by your organisation?
a) political
b)socio-economic
c)crime
d)terrorism/national security
e) human interest
f) light humour

Political - e.g relationship between two countries. Socio-economic, terrorism and national security, crime, human interest. All of the above except light humour.

4) What kind of reporters are assigned to cover issues of transborder migration/migrant workers?a) seniority and experience of reporters?b) editorial beat

Editorial beat.

5)What resources does your organisation allocate for the coverage of transborder migration/migrant workers? a) reporters/correspondents b)subject matter specialists c)specialised training d)specialised research materials/library/database

Reporters, correspondents, subject matter specialists.

6)What kind of background knowledge do the journalists in your organisation have in transborder migration issues? a)international and immigration law b)human rights c)international relations d)social work e)others

The news desk has editors who are aware of international / immigration law. Also social work.

7) Does your organisation hire foreign immigrants for editorial/reportage work? *Yes.*a) how many *Unsure*b)from what countries?

### Korea and Indonesia.

8) Does your organisation have specific editorial policies and ethical guidelines for covering foreign migrants/immigrants?

No.

9)What obstacles if any, does your organisation face in the coverage of transborder migration issues?

a) public apathy
b)financial constraints
c)state censorship/pressure
d)editorial biases
e)racist/nationalist attitudes
f)ignorance of journalists
g) poor standards of reporting
h) others

No obstacles like the ones mentioned above.

10) How can your organisation improve or extend coverage of transborder migration?
a) training and education for journalists
b)editorial policies
c)hiring policies
d) reallocation of resources
e) others

Editorial Policies.

INTERVIEW TWO Name (withheld) Designation: Senior Exec. Broadcast Journalist Type of Media: TV Network Ownership: Private Reach: National and Regional Audience share/circulation: 1.5 - 2 million viewers

1) From an editorial point of view, how important is the coverage of transborder migration/migrant workers (whether documented or undocumented/legal or illegal) for your organisation?

It's important. One of many issues.

## 2) How often does your organisation cover issues of transborder migration?

We cover it if it comes up. We do have stories like illegal migrants from Indonesia and Vietnam. Not every day. If there is a riot, that warrants coverage. There was recently a person who set fire to himself and burned himself to death at the UNHCR office in Kuala Lumpur. That was taken up by all media. I would say coverage is on an ad-hoc basis. If migrants have problems, or cause problems, we'll take along a crew.

**3**) What is the nature of the reports on transborder migration written and broadcast by your organisation?

- a) Political
- b) socio-economic
- c) crime
- d) terrorism/national security
- e) human interest
- f) light humour

All of the above. When they commit crimes, serious crimes, everybody - whoever it isgets to be on tv. As for social aspects, during Hari Raya (\*national holiday and festival after the Muslim fasting month of Ramadhan), we do go to the 'kongsi' houses (\*where groups of workers live in one place) and construction sites and ask for example, what it is like to be away from home. At Christmas, we have focused on Filipino maids, their plight. I don't think we distinguish between legal or illegal, although we assume they are legal. If they are illegal, then they would have to be reported (to the authorities). While the Indonesians are the majority here, there are also Nepalese. Whatever is newsworthy.

4) What kind of reporters are assigned to cover issues of transborder migration/migrant workers?a)seniority and experience of reporters?b) editorial beat

Anybody - well, not anybody. They must be senior enough. Say, 10 years' experience. Or at least 2 years or 5 years and above - confirmed staff, no trainees. Permanent staff are sent. The most senior reporters are normally sent for the Prime Minister. I would say a reporter who is in 'the middle' in terms of experience, will usually go.

## 5) What resources does your organisation allocate for the coverage of transborder migration/migrant workers?

- a) reporters/correspondents
- b)subject matter specialists
- c) specialised training
- d) specialised research materials/library/database

We have a library on line that is linked to all papers and databases of say Utusan Malaysia, Berita Harian, TV3, for us to refer to get background materials. It also has information from all the wires – Reuters, AFP etc. We ask the immigrants themselves. We get experts and authorities' points of view. For example, in the case of the guy who burnt himself to death, we interviewed UNHCR, witnesses, embassies, ministers involved. In the case of Indonesian immigrants, we also get the Home Ministry point of view.

6) What kind of background knowledge do the journalists in your organisation have in transborder migration issues?
a) international and immigration law
b)human rights
c)international relations
d)social work
e)others

I would say human rights. We often source SUHAKAM (\*Malaysian Human Rights Commission.)

**7) Does your organisation hire foreign immigrants for editorial/reportage work?** *Not at the moment.* 

a) how many Don't know.
b) from what countries?
We did have at one point, a lady from the UK or US as editorial consultant. About 5 years ago.

## 8) Does your organisation have specific editorial policies and ethical guidelines for covering foreign migrants/immigrants?

Not that I am aware of. No specific guidelines/instructions. We report it as it is. I remember at one point, there was a riot caused by Indonesian workers in Seremban (\*main town in nearby state), involving about 250 with the police. Some officers were injured; it happened in one of the factories. We consulted the Indonesian Embassy, the Ambassador had a chance to address the issue. We did a follow up story on illegal migrants. Definitely, illegal migrant rioting is a problem.

9)What obstacles if any, does your organisation face in the coverage of transborder migration issues?
a)public apathy
b)financial constraints
c)state censorship/pressure
d)editorial biases
e)racist/nationalist attitudes
f)ignorance of journalists
g) poor standards of reporting
h) others

None.

10) How can your organisation improve or extend coverage of transborder migration?
a) training and education for journalists
b)editorial policies
c)hiring policies
d) reallocation of resources
e) others

Training and education for journalists.

## **MEDIA SUMMARY – PHILIPPINES**

By David Celdran

## **Background – Data gathering process**

Radio and TV are the most accessible and popular source of entertainment and information in Asia and therefore believed to be the most influential in terms of moulding public opinion. Radio and television news and public affairs programs certainly offer daily images, thematic discussions of migrant populations. Therefore, documentation and recording of Audio/Video recordings of top rated newscasts were made to determine editorial biases, proportion of stories and news resources allocated to migration issues. Recording was also made of top rated public affairs (talk/magazine) programs to identify editorial treatment of migration issues and public views of such (represented by studio guests or 'man-on-the-street' interviews)

## Summary of Samples Gathered:

## a) TV NEWS

News reports were compiled from ABS-CBN Broadcasting (TV Network) in 2002 - the year that saw the biggest crisis concerning transborder migration in the country. The reports detail the deportation of the huge Philippine migrant population in the disputed Malaysian state of Sabah. The string of stories provides insight into the nature of media reporting on issues of migrant populations. The 'Sabah Crisis', as it was called in Manila, reveals the lack of training, depth and historical perspective required to cover issues of migrants properly. It also shows how nationalist sentiments among journalists can often overshadow the discussion of migration issues. It likewise reveals the power of TV images to ignite outrage and influence national policy. It was pictures of the starving refugees, which created the diplomatic crisis between Kuala Lumpur and Manila. That the refugees have been altogether forgotten since the coverage last year is yet another aspect of media that needs further scrutiny. One other story about the arrest of Chinese immigrants also gives a glimpse of the majority of stories aired regarding foreign migrants in the country.

## b) Collation of print materials.

Daily broadsheets and newsmagazines are often the media of choice for the 'policy elite' in Asian societies. Editorials and columns that discuss migration issues often reflect and frame the political discourse on the matter. Collation included the following.

- a. Collection of clippings of most widely read columnists to identify the way they frame migration issues.
- b. Collection of clippings of news headlines/main stories on migration issues to see the editorial process and resources used by news organization in the reporting of stories.
- c. Gathering of surveys, studies and research papers widely used by media as their framework for covering trans-border migration.

## **Summary of Newspaper Articles**

As revealed by the survey questions, news coverage of immigrant populations is marginal.

If and when, immigrants make it to the headlines, it's due to the attention they attract, because of their involvement in crime or scandal. Because these news reports are often the only times the public knows of these populations, stereotypes are formed and biases reinforced.

The numerous articles collected between 2001-2002 show how foreign migrants periodically figure in Philippine newspaper reports. The majority of the stories are related to criminal acts that are stereotyped according to nationality: eg. Chinese – drugs and kidnapping; Indians – Illegal money lending practices. And in the aftermath of 9/11, Muslim migrants formerly ignored by the media are now prominently exposed in the news for their connection to international terrorism: eg. Indonesians and Malaysians – Jemaah Islamiya/Al Qaeda terrorists.

To provide balance, I also included a few other articles that prove that not all reporting about foreign migrants is negative. There are a few journalists who do attempt to deepen the understanding of migrants through thoughtful pieces in the news.

**Summary of Survey/Interviews**. News editors and programming executives are responsible for the choice of stories and programs that go to print or to air. Their own viewpoints on migration issues consciously or unconsciously determine the content, treatment and resources allocated to the coverage and discussion of such issues.

### - David Jude St. Ana, News Director, ABS-CBN News

Using the survey as a guide, David Jude Sta. Ana, News Director of ABS-CBN *News, was interviewed to find out what importance ABS-CBN gives to news* regarding foreign migrants and the resources allocated for the coverage of such." Very little", Sta. Ana says. "It's a case to case basis", he adds, meaning that foreign migrants only make the headlines when they get into trouble – for fake passports, drug smuggling, terrorist threats and sex crimes. Although ABS-CBN invests heavily in covering Filipino migrant workers in other countries (through foreign affairs reporters, foreign bureaus in the Middle East and North America and beat reporters assigned to cover the welfare of overseas Filipino workers and their families at home), not a single reporter is assigned to migrant populations in the Philippines. According to Sta. Ana, because what little coverage of foreign migrants is related to crime, it is often the crime reporters (the most junior of the lot) who cover the stories for the network. Sta. Ana however says that special news teams may be organized, but only if the stories reach crisis proportions like in the case of the Indonesians suspected of links with Al Qaeda, or the hundreds of thousands of Sabah deportees. Otherwise, crime reporters, reporters stationed at the main airport and junior reporters are those assigned to cover what Sta. Ana considers as "sensational" situations that involve foreigners in the country.

### Julie Yap Daza, Editor in Chief, Manila Standard:

Daza admits that her paper gives very little attention to migrant communities in the country. This, she explains, is due to the rather low-key posture migrants take. The exception is the Chinese community, which, despite their attempt to keep a low profile, have attracted media attention because of their economic clout and alleged links to the crime underworld. Chinese, however, have assimilated with Filipinos over the centuries and are often no longer considered as an immigrant community.

Her paper, like all other newspapers in the country, does not have a specific reporter assigned to cover these communities. The Manila Standard does however have a diplomatic reporter who covers the diplomatic community but that is usually limited to "Socials involving the ambassador". Daza hopes to give more attention to migrant communities in the future, but for now she admits that "Unless they get into trouble, very little is written about them".

### Dondi Ocampo, Executive Producer, ABS-CBN "Headlines":

Ocampo laments that despite conscious efforts on the part of some producers and editors, reporting about migrant communities in the Philippine still reflects established stereotypes. In his experience, he has seen how deeply ingrained biases find itself in the coverage of certain nationalities: eg. Japanese – sex crimes; Koreans – human smuggling; middle easterners – terrorism; Chinese – kidnapping and drug syndicates.

This practice continues largely because of the ignorance and indifference of many journalists covering the news. Ocampo cites the fact that reporters and editors are usually oblivious to foreign culture and history. Added to this is the tendency of journalists to take on the side of the hosting country as opposed to a more objective point of view when reporting issues involving foreign migrants. And since most coverage involving foreign migrants is linked to acts of crime (perpetrated by them or against them), it is crime reporters that are assigned to these stories. Crime reporters, Ocampo notes, are often the least experienced, and the tradition of crime reporting in the country overtly sensationalist. "The effect of this on the minds of viewers is to associate foreigners with crime – if only subconsciously".

He however says that special training on the coverage of migrants and sensitivity courses can help change this. Foreign affairs reporters, or special beat reporters with more experience and global perspective should also replace crime reporters when covering foreign nationals in the country.

### Marites Vitug, Editor in Chief, Newsbreak Magazine:

Not all reporting of foreign migrants in the country is negative however. At Newsbreak magazine, the editors make it a point to provide fresh perspectives on all issues – including foreign nationals. Vitug does however admit to the difficulty of increasing coverage of such issues. "With most news organizations facing financial stress, investment in reporters covering 'niche' stories is hard to justify". And because of the relative quiet these communities go about their daily lives, there is also very little public interest in such stories. This hasn't stopped the magazine from doing a special report on the Jewish community in the country for example, but Vitug admits, these are few and far between. She does note that after 9/11, there has been a slight increase in interest in south east asian communities - especially Indonesians living in the country. Although Vitug has written extensively about the early settlement of Indonesians in the country, she notes that there is less interest in their history as a people these days as more journalists concentrate on their potential danger to security and terrorism instead.

### Paul Henson, General Assignment Reporter, TV Patrol

For the past three years, Paul Henson has been working as a general assignment reporter for TV PATROL, the Philippines' top rated primetime newscast. Loyola explains that most stories involving immigrants are assigned to general assignment reporters like him. The general assignment beat is a catch-all term for stories that fall out of the narrow confines of traditional news beats like defense, politics, business, etc.

In his work as GA reporter, the issues concerning immigrants, foreign migrant workers and foreign nationals are almost always tied to crime, terrorism and domestic abuse (foreigners married to Filipinas). There are very few occasions, Henson explains, when a story involving a foreign migrant worker makes it to the news unless he or she is suspected of connections to foreign terrorist networks or crime and drug syndicates.

Traditionally, the bulk of these stories involve Chinese nationals and illegal immigrants hunted down or captured in relation to illegal drugs manufacturing and distribution. But since the increase of terror attacks in the Philippines over the past 3 years, Arabs, Indonesians and Asian Muslims in particular have been included more and more in the regular news coverage as government efforts to expose terror networks operating in the country increases.

Henson explains that there is no deliberate effort to paint a negative picture of Chinese or Muslim foreigners, but that, in his words "I only have to cover the facts as they're presented by the authorities".

However, he goes on to lament that "getting the other side of the picture" has often been difficult because of the language barrier (Chinese, Indonesian) and also because the high security-risk nature of the captured foreigners makes access to them extremely hard.

Henson admits that a reporter like him does not get much in terms of training for the job of covering immigrant issues and international relations. According to him, "Most reporters learn on the job and there is hardly any mentoring or guidance available, more so, formal training that prepares us for covering migrants and foreign nationals". When Henson was sent to cover the crisis over illegal immigrants in Sabah last year, he admitted to not knowing much about the long history of the crisis and about the people involved.

He however explains that given the deliberate emotional tone of the coverage, a reporter's ignorance of history and diplomatic issues is hardly put to use. "We were told to concentrate on dramatic and tear-jerker stories that sell, so we would play up stories of victimization and downplay analysis pieces that were discarded by the (news) desk anyway".

Henson admits that it's difficult covering issues involving foreigners because the nationalist perspective always emerges. Though he tries to conscious of his biases, editorialized news reporting is a formula in local news that clicks with viewers. Despite the problems, Henson feels stereotyping of foreign migrants and a better coverage of transmigration issues can be achieved through better training programs for reporters and desk editors alike. In particular, solid investigative reporting techniques must be popularized in order to counter the "sensationalist" tradition on Philippine TV news. But above all, according to Henson, news bosses must take a risk and discard the old "formula" of emotional and sensationalized reporting in order to raise the awareness of the public.

### Avic Marillo, Communications Director of Senator Manuel Villar, chairperson of the powerful Foreign Relations committee.

Most of the information about foreign migrants in the country that reaches the senator is from media, and television in particular. "The influence of media on the Senator's legislative and policy agenda is obvious". According to her, the senator's decision to pressure the President to file a diplomatic protest against Malaysia for the treatment of illegal Filipino immigrants was entirely based on the emotional treatment of the issue by the Philippine media. Likewise, the revival of territorial claims over Sabah by the Senate Committee on Foreign relations was in part triggered by television reports.

### CONCLUSIONS

- 1. Philippine media gives little attention to transborder migration into the country for the following reasons:
  - Relatively small and low key foreign migrant population in the country
  - Media organizations do not allocate substantial manpower and resources for the coverage of foreign migrant populations
  - Public disinterest in issues concerning foreign migrant populations except in cases of national security (terrorism) and crime.
  - Apathy of news staff in issues concerning foreign migrant populations
  - Absence of foreign nationals (especially Asians) in media organizations

- 2. Philippine Media have the tendency to build and reinforce stereotypes of foreign migrant populations through:
  - High profile coverage of foreigners associated with crimes and other illegal activities:
    - Chinese immigrants with kidnapping, smuggling and drug syndicates
    - Korean immigrants with human smuggling
    - Middle Eastern Arab immigrants and students with terrorism
    - Indonesian migrant workers with terrorism
  - Inexperience and ignorance of reporters and editors in transborder migration issues
  - Sensationalization of stories involving conflict with foreign nationals
- 3. Philippine media, while capable of stereotyping and reinforcing biases against foreign migrants, is generally open to correction and improvement due to:
  - A free media institution that makes access to information possible and which guards against manipulation and censorship from government
  - Market sensitivity that makes media vulnerable to pressure groups like NGOs, International Pressure Groups and Foreign Embassies
  - o Libel laws
  - The presence of Media watchdog organizations
  - An open society with long tradition of tolerance towards foreign nationals
- 4. Philippine Media plays a major influence in framing diplomatic relations and domestic legislation that affects foreign migrants.

**RECOMMENDATIONS**: Media organizations could improve reportage concerning foreign migrants by

- 1. Giving more attention to covering issues of foreign migrants
- 2. Providing more resources, like reporters and airtime, for the coverage of said issues
- 3. Providing journalists with training in issues affecting foreign migrant populations like regional history, labour and international law, human rights, etc.
- 4. Promoting journalistic ethics, objectivity and factual reporting
- 5. Diversifying sources of stories on foreign migrants to include support groups and NGOs working with migrants
- 6. Opening up employment, or internship programs, to foreign nationals (esp. Asians), and the sending of Filipino journalists abroad (Asia)
- 7. Developing deeper exchanges and links with media organizations across Asia, specifically, alternative media groups that specialize in migration issues
- 8. Guarding freedom of speech and expression in media

## **MEDIA SUMMARY – THAILAND**

## **By Prasopsee Sookmark**

## Note

In general, the media in Thailand base their reporting on national policy. They have reporters based at the Ministry of Labour. As such, their reports seem to reflect national policy and the government stance, rather than make any attempts to influence policy. When reporting on migration issues, their focus generally is on breaking news or crimes.

## Thai Rath Newspaper

This newspaper has the widest coverage, according to A.C. Nielson, and prints one million copies of the newspaper daily. (Twice a month, on the 16 and the  $30^{\text{th}}/31^{\text{st}}$ , the day when the national lottery drawing is reported, 1.2 million copies are printed.) They produce 5 versions of the 40-page newspaper, for sale in the 4 geographical regions and the Bangkok Metropolitan area, with news that responds to their interests. One additional version, only for Bangkok, is released in the afternoon.

In the past year, government policy has been aimed at fighting drugs and purging mafia, which in one way or another affects migrants, because they may be involved in both activities as perpetrators and victims. Of interest was the fact that in May 2003, the government announced that it would start a crackdown on employers of undocumented migrants in the border areas.

In the past year, *Thai Rath* Newspaper had a total of 12 reports concerning undocumented migrants, that are oriented towards identifying the number of undocumented migrants in the country, arresting undocumented migrants and arresting the perpetrators of human trafficking activities. Interestingly, the tone of the newspaper is very factual, without stigmatization or stereotyping of undocumented migrants. Looking at the headlines, they seem to be more concerned with arrests - however, within the articles concerning arrests, they also report on the abuse of undocumented migrants by employers. In addition, those arrested for facilitating movement across borders are portrayed as officials, or those with influence, who are breaking the law.

The articles reviewed are relatively short on providing factual information. Of the twelve articles, two were longer scoops, concerning the facilitation of cross-border and internal movement of Burmese undocumented migrants by a police officer, who was immediately dismissed pending investigation.

While *Thai Rath* had 12 articles concerning the migrant workers, the *Daily News* had 21, *Manager* had 23 and *Matichon* had 22. On the other hand, the English newspapers had relatively more reports - the *Bangkok Post* had 90, and the *Nation* had 30. It may be possible to say that this difference stems from the fact that *Thai Rath* does not have a section covering quality of life like *Daily News*, and is a newspaper that sells breaking news that is not oriented towards business, as in *Manager* and *Matichon*. On the other hand, the *Bangkok Post* has an Outlook section that covers human rights issues, while the *Nation* is oriented towards business and politics.

A source at Thai Rath provided the following:

*Thai Rath* is a newspaper that is predominantly concerned with issues that are at the forefront of public interest. As a newspaper with the widest readership nationwide, management is mainly concerned with covering news that directly concerns the readers such as political issues, crime and current issues. As such, the issue of migration both documented and undocumented of foreigners and Thai nationals is addressed only when it directly affects the public in the form of policy changes and crimes.

From the management perspective, the newspaper has limited resources to cover the breaking news, thus it is not possible to focus on the issue of migration.

*Thai Rath* provides reporters with in-house training to improve reporters' investigative reporting skills and also encourages reporters to attend training sessions offered by the Association of Reporters and Newspapers.

In covering labour issues, reporters from a pool are assigned as available to attend press conferences and stand-by at the Ministry of Labour. However, there are no specialists directly involved in covering the issue of migration.

News, concerning migrants, is presented as perceived by reporters and news editors, and headlines are determined as deemed appropriate. The newspaper does not have a policy concerning migrants and any slant at which news coverage is to be presented, other than information provided by the source and the level of awareness of the issue on the part of the reporter and the editor. Any semblance of stereotyping of migrants is unintended.

It is not possible to label a Thai newspaper according to quantity or quality because generally, the content of the news in the majority of papers are very similar, with differences only in the style of reporting. Moreover, the main objective of the editors is presentation of news that is of the highest interest to the public at the time.

The reporter that this author contacted said that his supervisor had advised him that he should not give an official interview, thus he was willing to talk *off the record*. The gist of conversation was:

The focus of news at *Thai Rath* is breaking news or events, basically suppression and arrests. The space that is provided for the reporter interviewed is on the front page, thus he does not really do scoops for that is the responsibility of other sections. When there are concerns of interest, he sometimes has to ask for space in other pages. However, that is not very often as *Thai Rath* covers migration on a very limited basis. The news on undocumented migration is usually government policies or crime, not really human interest or for the education of the general public.

### **Bangkok Broadcasting and Television, Channel 7**

In an interview with Mr. Sommai Sillapeyodom, Editor, News Department, Bangkok Broadcasting and Television Channel 7 on November 13, 2003, information was given that Channel 7 provides national coverage and that their viewership for news is approximately 12 to 13 million viewers. However, it is possible to receive Channel 7 in Laos and Cambodia too. In general, news coverage is as follows:

6.00 am	rural interests	5 mins.
7.20 am.	children's and youth interests	5 mins.

7.35 am	breaking news	3 mins.
8 am	economic news	10 mins.
11 am.	mid day news	30 mins.
1.15 pm.	breaking news	3 mins.
3 pm.	breaking news	3 mins.
6 pm.	breaking news	30 mins.
7.20 pm.	evening news	1 hr.
10.15 pm.	breaking news	3 mins.
11.25 pm	breaking news	3 mins.
12.25 am	breaking news	3 mins.

Newscasts are generally short. The reporter covering migration issues has general education in the social sciences and is stationed at the Ministry of Labour. No specialized training is deemed necessary for the reporter, thus the training that is received is on-the-job training.

Migration issues are perceived as a major issue, that has been in existence for a long time, but that has not been addressed appropriately, as government policies are viewed as piecemeal and without wholehearted commitment to resolving the issue, possibly due to other interests.

Thus Channel 7 news presentation provides news that is in the public interest, through coverage of suppression, arrests and events, such as registration of undocumented migrants and crime. *The few times that reporters have gone out with the police to arrest employers of undocumented migrants in factories, the workers were not there. Thus there are leaks everywhere, and it is perceived to be a waste of resources to go after such events. As a result, very few scoops on the issue are pursued.* 

It should be noted that Channel 7 does not have talk shows for serious issues. The majority of Channel 7 viewers are rural communities who may not understand academic or bureaucratic jargon. However, inviting politicians who can communicate with rural communities may be viewed as currying political favour. Thus talk shows in the past have not been successful, because they were not able to pull ratings.

Stigmatisation and stereotyping of migrant workers is not considered to be an issue, because of the limited time available in providing news and coverage that follows government policies, rather than stimulates policies. The issue of undocumented migrants is a very delicate one, because it has numerous implications that may affect international relations. An important fact is that Channel 7 *is affiliated with the Royal Thai Army* thus it has to be very careful of the repercussions of its presentations.

It is perceived that interest in undocumented migrants is limited, and the implications of future social problems have not really struck home. When various social issues were raised, Mr Sillapeyodom said he was not really aware of the issues, because his sources were government sources. In addition, in the past it was possible to send reporters to

cover academic seminars. However, with the amount of news to be covered and the limited time available, unless big wigs attend the seminar, news people do not really attend. Even if they were provided with documents, they would not have the time to read it all.

Coverage of Thai migrant workers is undertaken when events happen such as Thai female workers in Hong Kong and Singapore, the situation in Iraq and the earthquake in Taiwan (it was covered unofficially due to the sensitivity of the issue of the status of Taiwan).

A noteworthy point was made to this author that the perspective is that if news reporters cannot have quotes from officially accepted individuals, it would not be newsworthy. The general feeling is that credentials and social acceptance is necessary for the news to be credible.

Yet undocumented migrants in Thailand are not really targeted for coverage. The news coverage that is provided is factual, with some newspapers - particularly the English press - providing coverage on the human rights of the migrants.

### Interview with Thai Action Committee for Democracy in Burma

In an interview with Mr. Adisorn Gerdmongkol of the Thai Action Committee for Democracy in Burma (<u>http://www.tacdb.org</u>) concerning his perspective on media reporting of the issue, Mr. Gerdmongkol stated that the main objective of Thai media is circulation. As such, they highlight "news" that creates impact, rather than the roots of the problems or alternatives for problem resolution. In addition, media focus is on reporting rather on reflection on the issue for the education of the public. This may be due to their lack of understanding of the issue, or due to the editorial framework that does not provide them with print space or airtime for social or human-interest stories.

### **Interview with Medical Assistance Programs Foundation**

An interview with Mr. Sansoen Duandee of the MAP Foundation (<u>http://www.map.org</u>) provided the perspective that both print and broadcast media do not provide the whole story, when the issue is presented. They provide partial information, which may result in misinformation and social biases. A case in point is the northern region of Thailand, which will be the hub of the new economic zone comprised of Thailand, Laos PDR, China and Myanmar. In order to develop northern Thailand appropriately, there is a need for migrant labour, particularly in the service sector. However, state management of the issue does not respond to the needs of the area and emphasizes economic issues only. In addition, media coverage of the issue reflects the state position, rather than presenting all aspects of the issue for the public to reach their own conclusions.

In general, the media is not impartial and presents news with attitudes and slants that influence public opinion negatively. Moreover, media stories are based on current events, without real investigative research into the background of the issue, and hence do not present alternatives for resolution of the problem. Regulations that are enforced are reactive rather than proactive, as they are issued from centrally located bodies that may not be aware of the diversity of needs in each affected region. The media should present the differences in the needs of both employers and migrant workers in each sector and region of the country in order to provide the public and the local and national governments with better understanding of the issues. So then they can deal with the problems in a more sustainable and proactive manner, rather than focusing only on the economic aspects of the problems.